

European Institute for
Crime Prevention and Control,
affiliated with the United Nations
(HEUNI)
P.O.Box 157
FIN-00121 Helsinki
Finland

Publication Series No. 37

Assessing International Assistance in Law Enforcement:

Themes, findings and recommendations from a case-study of
the Republic of Estonia

Bill Heberton and Jon Spencer

Helsinki 2001

Copies can be purchased from:

Academic Bookstore
P.O.Box 128
FIN-00101 Helsinki
Finland

Criminal Justice Press
P.O.Box 249
Monsey, NY 10952
USA

ISBN 952-5333-05-1
ISSN 1237-4741

Page layout: DTPage Oy, Helsinki, Finland
Printed by Tammer-Paino Oy, Tampere, Finland

Acknowledgements

This report relates to a project, which spanned, from inception to completion, the period 1996-1999. Over the lifetime of the research, we accumulated numerous debts of gratitude – only a few of which will be mentioned here. Some people go unmentioned for reasons of confidentiality, others because of lack of space. But we wish to thank all who spoke with us about the research, who gave of their time in interviews and who provided unmatched hospitality. Our greatest thanks must go, first and foremost, to Ms. Terhi Viljanen, Senior Programme Officer at HEUNI, who was an outstanding project mentor and guide to our first fumbling footsteps in the Baltic region. Her urbane style and knowledge of international relations opened many doors, which otherwise would have remained closed. Other colleagues at HEUNI, former director Matti Joutsen, Seppo Leppä and Kristiina Kangaspunta shared their considerable expertise with us in the early days. We wish to record our grateful appreciation to them all. We extend our sincere thanks also to Mr. Georg Maak, Councillor of the Administrative Support Unit (International Relations) of the Estonian National Police Board and to Mr. Harry Tuul, Director General of the Board, Mr. Matti Launiainen of the Ministry of Interior (Police Department), Finland, Mr. James Richardson of Strathclyde Police, Scotland, and Mr. D. Vickers of HM Embassy in Tallinn, Estonia.

Specific organisations and agencies played a significant part in our work and we gratefully acknowledge their assistance: in Tallinn, the US Legal Attache Section and the Federal Bureau of Investigation, the UNDP office, and colleagues from the Estonian Future Studies Centre and Tallinn Technical University; we also thank colleagues from Paikuse Police School and the Estonian National Defence and Public Safety Academy (Police College). Elsewhere, we wish to thank colleagues from Tampere Police School, Finland and representatives of the Nordic Baltic Police Academy.

Finally, we most gratefully acknowledge the financial support of the US State Department (Washington DC), without whose generous aid this project would not have been possible.

Contents

Acknowledgements	III
1. International assistance and policing	1
2. A case study of Estonia: the context of social transition, international assistance and the dynamics of crime	5
3. Phase Two results	15
4. Phase Three results	25
5. Discussion and conclusions	33
6. Recommendations	43
Bibliography	45
Appendices	49

List of Tables

Table 1	A model of transition	6
Table 2	Questionnaire results: satisfaction levels	15
Table 3	Perceived use of course content	16
Table 4	Rank, length of service, basic training	17
Table 5	Course sample – interview sample	18
Table 6	A model of international assistance in training	37

**IGAÜHEL ON ÕIGUS VABADUSELE JA
ISIKUPUUTUMATUSELE**

[trans. *Everyone is entitled to liberty and security of person*]

Eesti Vabariigi põhiseadus, II peatukk s. 20

[*The Constitution of the Republic of Estonia, section 20*]

1 International assistance and policing

International criminal justice assistance efforts have increased dramatically in recent years. Such assistance has, of course, both a broader background and a more specific context. At the broader level, this assistance needs to be seen against the background of the promotion of democracy in general. By the mid 1990s, most western donors were undertaking significant activity explicitly concerned with the promotion of democracy (see for example, Diamond 1992; Carothers, 1995). Canada, for instance, had established the International Centre for Human Rights and Democratic Development, and was incorporating a number of democracy-building initiatives into its official development assistance. The USA had enshrined democracy promotion as one of the four core priorities of its aid programme and initiated democracy-related programmes in almost every country receiving US aid. The Federal Republic of Germany was continuing its long-standing efforts to support democratic development in many countries through the *Stiftungen*, the political party foundations, and the German Ministry of Economic Co-operation was debating the possibility of itself establishing democracy programmes. The Finnish, Danish, Swedish, Norwegian and Dutch official aid agencies had all begun to sponsor democracy programmes in parallel with and sometimes overlapping with aid to promote human rights and good governance. The European Union and the Council of Europe had created special assistance funds for promoting democracy in Eastern Europe, the former Soviet Union, and elsewhere. The UK government development assistance also emphasised promotion of good governance, with funded initiatives through the Foreign and Commonwealth Office Know-How Fund.

Most commentators recognise a duality of purpose characterising these recent western aid efforts aimed at democracy promotion. On the one hand and in some cases, they are based primarily on the idea of promoting democracy for its own sake, as a political good or norm that will improve the daily existence of citizens by bringing more freedom, political representation and governmental (institutional) accountability. Second, and in other cases, democracy-related effort is rooted in a notion that democracy is a key goal since it will further social and economic development – in a sense, democracy thus taken as an element of an overall approach to attaining credible sustainable development. A major government institution in any country, the police (or more broadly law enforcement functions) in emerging democracies have been and are a current focus of attention by western donors. This leads us to the more specific context of international assistance to law enforcement, to which we now turn.

It would appear that there are two major purposes underlying the rapid expansion of international donor training and technical assistance in law enforcement. First, as a response to the perceived growth and seriousness of transnational criminality that has the potential to victimise domestic populations (see for example Heberton and Thomas 1998). Such crime has arguably roots in the rapid

economic, political and technological changes around the globe and police assistance responds to changes in the post cold war international security environment. Second, to assist emerging democracies in establishing the rule of law – itself seen as a precondition to the consolidation of democratic governance and the creation of effective market economies. More specifically, to promote modern, democratic policing practices based on the rule of law and capable of tackling crime at all levels, with assistance supporting the police as a key institution affected by reform processes (see the recent definitive assessment in Bayley, 2001). In many cases these two purposes converge: this is especially so because specific emerging democracies are often perceived by western nations as significant ‘base-stations’ for transnational criminality due to the weakness of their police and criminal justice structures and other factors. The weakened ability of many such countries to respond effectively to crime has contributed to an increase in both ordinary crime and other forms such as financial, environmental and organised crime. Furthermore, in some cases, endemic corruption and mismanagement have sapped much investment in development, endangering the success of international assistance generally, including the provision of aid and economic opportunities. Thus, the selected focus of international cooperation on strengthening the economic and technical infrastructure of society, while ignoring law enforcement (police) functions, has proved too narrow in two respects: first, the increasing burden of crime control in the recipient countries detracts in general from the success of broader assistance. Secondly, crime, through corruption, has directly and indirectly siphoned off some of the development assistance.

International assistance is provided through three means: international programs, police agency to agency links, and bilateral agreements. In the 1990s international agencies provided a number of initiatives. In this context, the United Nations has been a key actor developing a number of conventions, recommendations working groups and so forth (Clark 1994). One of the goals set out in Article 55 of the United Nations Charter is the promotion of conditions of economic and social progress, with a view to the creation of overall stability and well being. Effective, efficient and fair criminal justice systems, based on the rule of law, are essential to establishing and maintaining such conditions of social stability and peace. In accordance with Article 55, the UN has since 1992 redirected its focus to providing technical assistance. The network of UN funded crime prevention/criminal justice institutes acted as the mechanism through which detailed projects were developed.

The second means of international assistance usually takes the form of cooperation on operational cases and exchange visits; such cooperation is organised by the police themselves, constrained only by existing international agreements and the general foreign policy context. Much European Union border policing has been of this form (Hebenton and Thomas 1995; den Boer 1995). Most western countries offer the final type of formal bilateral, country to country assistance. For example, the French *Police Nationale*, maintain over 50 standing delegations abroad who help coordinate training assistance and international case cooperation. Similarly, UK police services throughout the 1990s have established technical assistance programs with many former Soviet states. But in the context of bilateral assistance, not surprisingly, the USA has been the major pro-

vider of international assistance. This US aid can be traced from after 1945, but more recently from the mid 1980s. In 1986 there was a US government push to establish effective police assistance to selected states in an effort to support reform of authoritarian police practices. The International Criminal Investigations Training Assistance Program (ICITAP) was set up for regional purposes (Latin America), funded by the Agency for International Development and the Department of State; its remit was then made global and extended to cover developmental and general training requirements. The Department of State's Bureau of International Narcotics and Law Enforcement Affairs enlarged in 1993 to create an Office of International Criminal Justice (see Travis (2000) for an insider's rationale). This Office coordinates training abroad and interagency work. More recently it coordinates assistance with the United Nations crime prevention and criminal justice network and indeed the European Union (Hebenton and Thomas 1998). In 1995, at the behest of Director Louis Freeh of the FBI, the International Law Enforcement Academy was established in Budapest (Hungary) and jointly funded by the US and Hungarian governments (Marenin 1998a). This was a key institutional development; it offers a central training resource in the European region and is staffed by both US and European police training officers. In general, the Academy seeks to provide programs for mid to high level police in the former Soviet states. Staff from almost all the US federal agencies (including FBI, Secret Service, Alcohol, Tobacco & Firearms) are involved in specific courses, which are residential and extend often up to eight weeks.

Acknowledgement of the importance of assistance issues was evidenced, when in December 1995, the National Institute of Justice (the research arm of the US Department of Justice) and the Department of State jointly hosted a two-day conference on the US role in policing in emerging democracies. The reported remarks of Director Fred Mecke of the Office of International Criminal Justice resonate with the key underlying theme of assistance cooperation "The interests of US law enforcement are enhanced by the long-term interests of other democratic system. We need to work in a multi-lateral context, with the United Nations and other international groups and countries." (*CJ International* 12(1) 1996). Also in this period, the Department of State (under the International Narcotics and Law Enforcement Training Affairs program) chose to provide funds in support of a UN database on police and criminal justice assistance projects in Eastern Europe – this was coordinated by the European Institute for Crime Prevention and Control (HEUNI) in Helsinki, Finland (see below for further details).

In respect of criminal justice and law enforcement assistance to Central and Eastern Europe, commentators have noted that the flow of assistance has not been unproblematic (see Joutsen 1996; Hebenton and Spencer 1996). For example, at times there has been considerable overlap in assistance projects to a single country, which may have detracted from their overall cost-effectiveness. The United Nations responded to this kind of problem by establishing the HEUNI *Database on International Projects in Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice in Central and Eastern European Countries* (via a decision of the Economic and Social Council, resolution 1995/12 of 24 July 1995). The *Database* was designed to assist UN member states in planning and coordinating their international assistance – and specifically to help policy-makers in improved allocation

of resources, the identification of overlaps and gaps in assistance, and the identification of opportunities for collaborative action with potential partners.

However, while initiatives such as the HEUNI *Database* were clearly needed and immensely valuable (for an assessment of the *Database*'s first two years of operation and wider policy issues see Viljanen, August 1997), adequate international coordination in itself does not directly shed light on how and in what ways the process of assistance takes shape, embeds itself and becomes effective or not. This, therefore, needed to be addressed through a detailed empirical assessment – a case-study of 'assistance-in-practice'. In the autumn of 1995, under the auspices of HEUNI, the authors drew up detailed research proposal for a case study of the Republic of Estonia; in late 1996 negotiations took place with the Republic of Estonia's State Police Board to undertake such a case study; it was argued and agreed that such a project would not only be of benefit to the specific donor-recipient assistance process of the Estonian police but could also provide an exemplar for international consideration. The overall aim for the project was to examine over time how forms and structures of assistance develop in the complex social and cultural context of a state in "transition-to-democracy" and undergoing rapid social change. Our working assumption was that assistance was best seen as the interaction between local and international policing, policy and political contexts. Viewed in this way, our methodology for the project had to address both donor and recipient contexts. Thus, the process of assistance was examined via our methodology in three phases. The first phase of the project was to develop an understanding of the complex social and cultural context of Estonian development, and of the role and function of the police within it. It was also to establish the nature and extent of assistance in the five years prior to our fieldwork. Phase two of the project was scheduled to examine recipient perceptions of the assistance process in a discrete area and to consider in more detail local contexts of training and policework in Estonia. The third phase was tasked with assessing the process of a discrete area of assistance from conception to actual delivery. Given logistical and other constraints, it was determined that training programs would be the most valuable and appropriate area for the project to examine in phases two and three.

In the remaining sections of this report, we set out the major results of the project. As indicated above, the project was conceived as a means of examining 'assistance-in-practice' and to provide evidence to policymakers and practitioners in this field. Yet these international practices need greater attention from the academic community. Although there is now a literature on international policing in general (for example, Nadelmann 1993; Anderson and den Boer 1994; Heberton and Thomas 1995; McDonald 1997), scholars and researchers have left largely unexamined the now substantial, growing market, exchange and capacity-building in police values, practices and technologies (but see the following exceptions: Heberton and Spencer 1994; Heberton and Spencer 1996; Heberton and Thomas 1998; Heberton and Thomas 1999; Spencer and Heberton 1997; Spencer and Heberton 2000; Marenin 1998b; Marenin 1998c; Anderson 1997; Nadelmann 1997). We hope that this report can act to direct further attention by researchers to these matters and perhaps help to generate greater theoretical sophistication and understanding.

2 A case study of Estonia: the context of social transition, international assistance and the dynamics of crime

The results reported in this section cover Phase One of the project and are based upon our collation and analysis of relevant background materials and indicators, together with analysis of expert and practitioner interviews (a full list is given as *Appendix One*) and an analysis of published sources (given in *Appendix Two*). The researchers spent a ten day period in Estonia, mainly in the capital Tallinn in mid 1997. The aims of this first phase of fieldwork were twofold: to provide a wider context within which to understand the process of assistance; and to undertake an audit, as comprehensive as possible, of assistance to the Estonian police from 1993 (selected as a baseline year) to 1997. The co-operation of the Estonian National Police (*Politseiamet*) was crucial in both obtaining access to relevant individuals and in the provision of transport and interpretation (*Appendix Three* details the structure of the police during the time of the project). A number of government officials and academics also provided an opportunity to explore complex issues from a range of perspectives. This section begins by providing a background to the political culture of transition, and then reflects on the role of the police and crime within this context. It also includes details of specific aspects of training and assistance that emerged in interview and reports the results of our audit of assistance for the period 1993–1997 (*Appendix Four*).

The gaining of independence resulted in a number of social, political and economic issues being defined as important for the future development of Estonia within the western democratic tradition. The issues of identity at both the individual and national levels along with changing patterns of work, lifestyles and the widening gap of economic prosperity and accompanying social inequality have resulted in Estonia experiencing rapid social change. These changes are encountered throughout day-to-day life from the de-population of the rural areas and the increasing move of people to Tallinn looking for more lucrative employment. The move to the market economy provides in abundance for some people and others experiencing hardship and social exclusion. With this come changes to the types of crime, to the definition of crime and changes to the structure, aims and demands of policing.

This report on the first phase of the research attempts to provide a context within which these changes and their relationship to crime can be more readily understood and theorised. It provides a model within which to understand how change occurs in societies in transition, the changes in relation to definitions of crime and how Estonian society has developed in relation to both policing and the management of crime.

Understanding Transition: A Model of Change

The move for Estonia from an integrated part of the USSR to independent state has not only resulted in changes to the day-to-day environment as outlined above but also to what Lauristin (1997:38) defines as the ‘symbolic environment’. So, the old structures of soviet communication have been largely eradicated and replaced so:

“New visual images fill the pages of newspapers and magazines, television screens, and posters on the streets. The most important change of the visual language is related to the exposure of the human body as a cultural sign”

(Lauristin 1997:38-39)

It is important to have a model within which to conceptualise such radical change and the following paradigm of societies in transition is felt to be useful:

Table 1. A model of transition.

Individualism (West)	Collectivism (East)
Individual identity – use of ‘I’, ‘Me’. Loose in Group relationships.	Group identity. Use of ‘we’, ‘us’. Tight in Group relationships.
Self and Immediate Family only. Looking after self.	Extended Family and in-group networks. Protection for loyalty.
Belief in competition. Challenge. Express self, assert uniqueness.	Belief in cooperation. Harmony, deference. Avoid confrontation.
Personal responsibility. Independence, maximise outcomes.	Shared responsibility. Interdependence, shared resources
Doing one’s own thing. Personal time. Values honesty, speak one’s mind.	Little time for self. Opinion pre-determined by Group.
Individual Freedom, right to privacy.	Equality and Group Consensus. Private life concealed.
Confrontation with authority. Resentment of conformity.	Acceptance of authority. Conformity.
Value originality, youth and initiative.	Value tradition, structure, hierarchy and conventions.
Control by guilt, conscience.	Control by shame and loss of face.

(Source: reproduced from Tower & Cooper 1995 in Lauristin 1997: 39, adapted)

Table 1 provides a means of comparing the different emphasis placed upon the personal and the collective within the different socio-economic systems of western capitalism and soviet style communism. It was from the former sovietised system of economic and social relationships from which Estonia was required to manage the transition to a market economy.

Policing The Transition

The key reform to the Estonian Police was the Police Act of 1991 and the establishing of the police as a civil agency in 1992. Prior to this, the police had been a militia force under the control of the military, which was the norm in Soviet Russia and the remainder of the Soviet bloc (Ivkovic and Haberfeld 2000). A key function of the Soviet Militia was to protect the existing regime, and it operated under the control of the Ministry of Internal Affairs; relics of communist policing included military-style organisation, communist mentality, its ways of understanding the mission of the police, and mystification of militia work - police and their duties were considered to be extraordinary, and the public were not even supposed to know what the police were doing, as this could reduce effectiveness. Public support was not a predominant feature of policing in the Soviet period. The civilianisation of the police in Estonia was not out of line with what happened in other Central-Eastern European countries, Poland for example (See Spencer & Heberton 1997). The State Police of Estonia operate directly under the control and subordination of the Ministry of Internal Affairs. The Estonian police have an establishment of 5900 officers (1996 figure) and actual strength of 4900 sworn-in officers (early 1997) and the current organisational structure of the police in Estonia are given in *Appendix Three*.

The Police and Organised Crime

Many of the police officers we spoke to identified organised crime as the biggest threat to law and order in Estonia. Officers saw the development of organised crime as having strong links with the development of a market economy (but see Karstedt 2000 for a more sophisticated view). There were various definitions of organised crime being used. Organised crime could be understood as being crimes committed by men who came together to undertake criminal activities, these activities could be relatively petty. There is a definition which views organised crime in the mould of the American Mafia, with hierarchical structures, payment of dues and with special reference on particular crime types, drugs, prostitution, smuggling, protection and car crime. The final form of organised crime is that of crime associated with privatisation processes, a form of insider dealing (for a sociological account see Varese 1994; Los 1988). The latter two are not mutually exclusive. The definition of organised crime in Estonia is:

“..... a criminal grouping or association is a stable acting group consisting of three or more persons with the group members’ functional distribution, whose activities are directed to committing offences of the I or II degree.”

(Estonian Penal Code 1995).

There have been a number of unintended consequences of criminal justice policy. Estonia like many Central-Eastern European countries declared an amnesty for prisoners in 1992. One outcome of this was a series of ‘turf wars’ between criminal groups attempting to re-establish their predominance in particular areas of criminal activity. During this early period there was a dramatic rise in violent crime and the amnesty is thought to have played a significant part in the increase. In 1993 there were some 365 murders and the Estonian Police view the majority of these as being a consequence of the ‘turf wars’ between various organised crime groups. However, this claim needs to be treated with some scepticism, Lehti’s (1997) research on homicide suggests that the number of homicides attributable to organised crime is no more than 25% and probably 15% of the overall rate. Account needs to be taken of other indicators, for example there is a link between the crime rate and deaths by alcoholic poisoning. A large number of homicides are either domestic, men murdering female partners or the resolution of disputes between males (see Polk 1994). Whilst the homicide rate for Estonia is still high it has declined markedly over the past three years.

In relation to crime in general and organised crime in particular the main problem area is Tallinn. The main activities of organised crime in Tallinn are protection/extortion, drugs and also the smuggling of luxury cars. It is also important to see how various crime types have an interconnectedness. For example; the theft of 70 guns from a local Tallinn Gun League in the latter part of 1997 was the work of ‘common criminals’, that is offenders not involved in organised crime. But it was only possible for these offenders to move the guns and get sell them by relying upon organised crime to either purchase them or to partake in the negotiations of the sale of the guns. It has been argued that these connections are more common than some people think.

The development of the Estonian economy has been particularly strong over the past three to four years (1992–1997) and this has provided the opportunities for organised crime to develop. All the criminal justice professionals we interviewed identified organised crime as a future threat and problem for the Estonian police and the Estonian state. One senior police officer stated:

“There are significant problems dealing with organised crime in Estonia. Very few cases are dealt with as people are afraid. The main activity of organised crime is extortion.”

The Development of A Professional Police Culture

A key issue to face the Estonian Police has been the need to develop a professional civilian police force. The police are seen as doing a difficult job with a po-

litical pressure to produce results. However, the greatest hindrance to the development of a professional police force in Estonia is the poor rates of pay which are common in the Estonian Police Force. There is a significant problem in recruiting and retaining police officers.

The provision of basic militia training during the soviet period was seen to be 'very good' and the new government has 'destroyed everything' by removing the whole of the militia structure and training strategy. The main loss is claimed to be an understanding of police education and the need to link theory with practice. So, the basic training is now perceived as too theoretical and fails to provide experience in relation to practice. However, this could be more a matter of not enough practice experience gained before officers are expected to be fully operational - if so then this is exacerbated by the failure to retain police officers. The retention of police officers at higher ranks is now also becoming problematic with only some 20%–25% of higher ranking police officers having militia experience.

However, many police officers were concerned with the reputation of the Estonian Police Force. The police do not have close connections with the public and the reputation of the police is not increasing over time. There are still deep suspicions of the police by the public. The general increase in the crime rate over time does not enhance the police's reputation with the public and it does not lead to an increasing sense of well being and safety and furthers a rise in the fear of crime.

The provision of basic training is concentrated at the Police School at Paikuse, Pärnu. The structure of the police school was introduced in the Soviet period and its survival according to one officer "...is a miracle". At the time of independence basic training programmes were introduced through the cooperation of the Finnish police at Tampere Police School.

There still remain considerable problems in relation to both recruitment and retention. In a recruitment exercise at the beginning of 1998 all of those selected for interview could have been selected if they had been suitable, there is no competition for posts. In 1996 there was a flow of officers from the police into other occupations with 176 more officers leaving than recruited. This suggests that there is a diminishing base of expertise and policing experience. In 1997 the anticipated out flow from the force is 200 more than recruited. This creates a number of problems, the most significant of which is the development of a positive police culture. As there is such a high staff turnover one of the consequences is low morale and the ability of some of the remaining police officers being less than required to do the job. Another reason, suggested to us, for low levels of replacement may be that police prefects are not replacing staff in order to increase the pay of those remaining officers. This strategy may also be linked to budgetary restraints. The police budget grew by 5% in 1996, this was the lowest in the public sector. The cost of training police recruits is some 8,000,000EEK for 250 recruits a round figure of 32,000EEK per recruit (approx. £1400). This figure also covers all costs, including capital expenditure. In 1996 the budget was less than 6.5mEEK and in 1993 the budget was the cost of 4 teachers at the police school. By 1997 the staff compliment had risen to some 24 teachers of whom 8 were on contract.

There has been a range of assistance in relation to the Police School: Sweden has provided an exchange programme, Strathclyde has provided assistance in teaching methods and Germany has provided individual programmes for teachers and furniture disused from previous NATO activities, such as wardrobes and beds. Tampere Police School has given assistance in furniture and teaching equipment. Foreign specialists have come to Paikuse to teach especially from Denmark, Holland, Sweden, and Germany. There have also been links with the Nordic Baltic Police Academy. It was hoped (in 1997) that a national fingerprint and a population database could be established – however, no donor aid is available for this work. Respondents also stated that there is a need for assistance in relation to policing strategy and its implementation, information gathering and analysis and enhancing police reputation. A considerable amount of this assistance is concerned with professional police activity and this is viewed as an area which requires inward investment.

One of the main problems in relation to police training and international programmes is language, for example the French police are keen to provide assistance but few police officers in Estonia can speak French. There is also the problem of the educational level of the police officer recruits, those students who have a wish to go to university do not see the police as their future, and many of the recruits are drawn from the vocational schools, which are of lower educational ability.

There were a number of interviewees who commented that the development of a more professional police force requires a move away from the previous ways of doing things and the need to take account of efficiency, economy and effectiveness criteria. These respondents considered that there should be a greater awareness of the implications of expenditure and the ‘doing away with the trappings of wealth’. This, they argued, should be accompanied by a definition of the management tasks in order to increase efficiency of all ranks. In order to implement reform many police managers consider it necessary to ensure that legislative change establishes policing structures independently of political administrative structures. Such a process of wide ranging reforms relies on the political process and the proposals have met resistance especially in the areas of: changes to working practices, change to prefectures and rank structure and legislative reform – but as one officer put it: “There is political opposition to such change”.

These areas of reform are seen to be necessary if the police are to become and be perceived as a professional, independent and accountable civilian force. The frequent political changes within the Ministry of The Interior have resulted in there being frequent appointments at the Director-General level, with nine DGs over a five year period.

Criminal Policy Formulation & Implementation

The formulation of criminal justice policy during the period of transition has varied over time. There were some crude policy initiatives, probably when policy making was viewed as having a direct cause and effect relationship. So, Estonia

like many Central-Eastern European countries had a prison amnesty only to experience soaring prison numbers in a very short period of time. Consequently, policy making and implementation can be seen as falling within the three periods after liberation. The first period sees only crude attempts at policy at the broadest level; the provision of a written constitution for example. The second period of restoration sees policy being made in relation to land reform, economic reform and other broad areas of social policy. Crime appears to fit into the third period, that of cultural and economic stabilisation.

During the period of restoration in Estonia much of the concentration in relation to criminal justice would have been on a system of verifying police officers and attempting to introduce an impartial and as uncorrupted as possible police force. The final period witnesses the development of policing policy – but the struggle to maintain an incorrupt and professional police force is still very much in existence as outlined above. This would seem to suggest that again policing is very much on the border between the two periods of liberation. The situation in relation to policing characterises the transitional nature of Estonian society in relation to the provision of public services. For example, it is clear that there had been considerable infrastructural investment in the police in areas such as communication systems. The radio system varies between digital equipment in Tallinn and analogue equipment across the rest of the country. The analogue system is old and an inheritance from the soviet period. There is no money forthcoming from the Minister of the Interior to up date radio communications across Estonia and so they are operating a split system. This causes some problems as the police require an integrated system of communications. There has been some assistance in this area predominantly from Norway. The assistance is generally in terms of equipment and there has been no specific training in relation to the implementation of the new systems. However, in relation to computerisation there is a reasonably sophisticated system in place. The government has established a permanent network (similar to an intranet) which links together police, border guard, immigration and customs through a DSIP system. Telephone lines have been leased from *Eesti Telecom* in order to allow the different policing and security structures to communicate with each other. There is an encryption network in place to ensure that the network is secure. There has been internal training provision in this area; specialists within HQ have been trained, Computer Support Staff and a very basic form of training for regular users. The Finnish Police have provided desktop computers and the Germans, through Siemens, the telephone system (cost DM1,000,000). There are future plans to develop an integrated radio network and to put in place equipment for call storing within command centres. There is also an attempt to provide mobile data systems through GPS (Global Positioning by Satellite) for patrol cars, again this is too expensive for all of Estonia and it will probably be located in Tallinn in the first instance. Whilst there is an identified need to develop policing links with other Baltic states, especially Latvia and Lithuania it is also recognised within the police that this will have to be done at an individual level as there is no development of these links in relation to the strategic development of policy in relation to communications systems.

There has been little legislative impetus in relation to juvenile offenders, although juveniles are responsible for over 50% of crime. The situation deteriorated after the demise of the Soviet Militia; the Militia had a system of responding to juvenile offenders through a scheme of 'Special Police Inspectors'. By 1993 a task force was established within the Estonian National Police Board and it demonstrated there was a need for a special unit to have overall responsibility in managing juvenile offenders. These developments were not linked to policy provisions at the wider level, in relation to the family for example.

In May 1994 the Juvenile Unit within the Estonian National Police Board was established. Within each of the 15 Prefectures there is a *Juvenile Officer* who has an overall responsibility for managing the issues of juvenile offending. There are between 100 and 110 juvenile police officers; in order to become a juvenile police officer a higher level of education is required, 60% of officers have a University education and 80% of officers are women. For 50% of their time juvenile officers are concerned with liaison work, the other half is made up of routine police work which might incorporate processing juvenile offenders. The Prefectures are required to report on juvenile matters to the Juvenile Unit at the Head Quarters of The Estonian Police as they have the overall responsibility of coordinating local activities and implementing policy.

The Juvenile Unit at Police Head Quarters has the overall responsibility of developing policy in relation to juvenile offenders. There is no official or legislative remit to do this but is undertaken by the Unit in order to try and develop a coherent approach to juvenile policing. The process of policy development is through a series of 'seminars' with juvenile police officers to define the problems and identify the solutions. One consequence of this is that policy development is very police orientated.

The juvenile section of the Estonian National Police Board has developed in co-operation with the Estonian Union for Child Welfare a range of materials for use with young people in schools. The materials focus on crime and drug use prevention. There were instruction packs for teachers and sets of OHP slides for juvenile police officers to use with teachers, parents and young people. During the summer months a martial arts programme had been run which was funded by agencies outside of the police. There has been assistance from Sweden and Finland in relation to juvenile crime which has included joint training seminars, there have also been training visits by Estonian Police Officers to Denmark.

There appears to be no long term strategic policy in relation to juvenile crime, there is little or no policy direction from above. The notion of defining the problems in relation to juvenile crime by using juvenile police officer seminars is a strategy which will deliver a very partial view of both juveniles and the crimes they commit. There is also a serious resource issue in that the implementation of policy which requires any resource allocation, however small, is perceived to be destined for failure. This coupled with the alienation of Russian youth and the lack of commitment to resolving the problems faced by these young people could result in considerable problems in the near future. Assistance in this area was received mainly from other Baltic states, there seemed to be very little USA or UK assistance in these areas. This is probably because the threat of young peo-

ple to these countries from Estonia is not great. However, the threat they pose is in relation to internal economic and social stability.

The area of crime prevention is also highly problematic. The Crime Prevention Division in the Ministry of Justice was established in 1994. The task of the unit is to manage and develop policy in relation to crime prevention and to coordinate the work of the National Crime Prevention Board (based on a Scandinavian model of crime prevention). The development of a National Crime Prevention Board has proved to be problematic inasmuch that the 15 Police Prefectures which should have put in place a crime prevention programme have not done so. This may be due to the relationships between the police and the local community often being very fragile and sometimes hostile. The police have a serious problem in communicating effectively with the communities with which they work. The difficulty partly relates to the soviet period when there was a deep distrust of the police and the police have little commitment to crime prevention. The ethos of policing and government policy is strategically concerned with punitive outcomes and this tends to exacerbate crime problems. The low level of commitment to crime prevention is demonstrated by the low level of funding; in 1996 the annual crime prevention budget was £5.9m EEK, this is roughly £215,000 or FIM2,128,500. This amount has to fund salaries, research, campaigns and equipment. It can be argued that crime prevention is a means of developing and safeguarding aspects of civil society (see for example Crawford 1998).

In 1994 the Council of Europe undertook a review of criminal sanctions in Estonia and recommended various forms of community based sanctions, which up to this time were not available. In 1996 the Estonian concept of Probation was defined and the law passed by parliament on Dec 17th 1997 with an implementation date of May 1st 1998. The introduction of probation has been assisted by the German Probation Service in a consultancy capacity. However, the design and introduction of the system has been one which has been allowed to develop from within the Ministry of Justice and takes account of Estonian conditions and culture.

There has been a national campaign to recruit probation officers. Higher education has been the main recruiting ground and it is hoped that higher levels of pay than the police will attract high calibre recruits. It is anticipated that a probation officer will earn a salary of 5,000EEK per month (£215.00), this is more than double the pay of a police officer. There is a training programme in place with 150 theoretical classes which cover social work, law and psychology. The training model is based on the German and Scandinavian models of probation officer qualifying training.

3 Phase Two results

For this phase of the research, the methodology employed both an agreed ‘audit’ questionnaire (See *Appendix Five*) and a series of semi-structured interviews. The questionnaire was discussed and formulated with the Estonian police. Translation of the questionnaire into Estonian was undertaken by the Estonian State Translation Centre. The total population list, 250 officers trained between 1995–1997 were asked to complete the questionnaire. There were no easily identifiable figures for named officers prior to 1995. To ensure anonymity and confidentiality name lists were linked with Personal Identification Numbers (PINs) and questionnaires were sent out with stamped addressed envelopes and a covering letter from the Estonian State Police Board. Any follow up letters requesting return were dealt with in the usual manner. The return was 73%, boosted to a final total of 77%.

Analysis of completed questionnaires (N= 192)

Table 2 sets out the results of our analysis on a range of satisfaction measures.

Table 2. Satisfaction levels (percentages).

	1 (lowest)	2	3	4	5 (highest)
Scheduling	24	6	6	10	55
Prior written information	3	3	4	15	75
Relevance	10	5	10	15	60
Taking account of prior experience	15	10	22	13	40
Extending knowledge	5	12	13	12	58
Level of technical language	5	5	15	10	65
Level of theoretical content	5	25	55	8	7
Level of practical content	10	25	15	25	25
Understanding of local context	30	37	16	7	10
Instruction	1	3	30	30	36
Maintenance of interest	4	10	25	30	31
Participation	11	26	55	3	5
Organisational arrangements	15	20	45	8	12

If we first consider knowledge of selection. Some 70% of officers were aware of the rationale for their selection for training. A significant minority (30%) were unaware.

Only some 18% had received prior written information about course content (70% had not; 12% don't know). Of those who had received written information in advance, levels of satisfaction were very high.

In relation to specific dimensions of courses then the results were complex and mixed, which may be because of the interrelationship between these variables. On relevance, there was bipolar split, with 25% being less than satisfied, yet the vast majority being highly satisfied. Only just over half were satisfied when it came to taking account of prior knowledge and experience. With regard to the appropriateness of the level at which the course was delivered, then again overall results were not unidirectional.

The majority of people were more than satisfied with the appropriateness of the language used (75%), but saw aspects of the courses as too theoretical. Most were more than satisfied with the level of practicality of course content. On the crucial issue of the extent which courses took account of the local context of Estonian policework, then the result was somewhat negative. Actual delivery of training was in general rated highly, the only exception being on levels of 'active' participation during sessions. Participants were in general satisfied with organisational arrangements (60% satisfied or more than satisfied), but a significant minority saw room for improvement. Turning to officers perceptions of how courses were evaluated, then only a minority had been asked to complete a formal end-of-course evaluation sheet (32%). Of those asked only 75% had returned the sheet.

Table 3 sets out respondents' perceptions of the extent to which they made use of course content. Results are encouraging on how participants saw the way in which what was learned on the course had been taken up in everyday work

Table 3. Perceived use of course content (percentages).

	Yes	No	Don't Know
Specific techniques learned	66	10	24
Equipment more effectively	71	11	18
New knowledge	73	12	15

When one cross-tabulates the responses, a few results are worth reporting. In general, those who had seen more opportunities to utilise what was gained from the courses, also tended to be more satisfied with all aspects of course content and overall course delivery. Officers who understood why they had been selected for the course had substantially higher overall levels of satisfaction about the courses as compared to those who had no notion of why they had been selected. Similarly, those who had been asked to complete an end-of-course evaluation sheet were, in general, more satisfied with both course content and course delivery.

Analysis of interviews

Our target rate was a 20% sample of officers who had received training from USA, Finland and UK donors – thus a target of 50 officers. This proved to be simply unachievable – due mainly to logistical constraints on the researchers. What follows is based on semi-structured interviews with a sample of **36** police officers who had received donor training programs in the period 1995–1997. The sample reflected, as far as possible, appropriate representation across police prefectures. Interviews took place in police HQ, Tallinn and were conducted via an interpreter (supplied from the Estonian Translation Centre in Tallinn). In addition to personal information, the protocol for the interviews centred on perceptions and experience of international assistance training. Interviews were transcribed and analysed according to the main themes of the project. Core findings are given here.

The interview sample included the Director and Deputy Director of the Criminal Police, 5 Chief Commissars, 10 Commissars, 14 Chief Inspectors, 4 Inspectors and one officer where we were unable to ascertain his rank. The majority of these higher ranking officers were drawn from a range of locations, including Economic Crime, Special Weapons and Tactics group (SWAT), Central Criminal Police, Public Protection and Crime Prevention, Traffic police, Criminal Intelligence, Serious Crime Unit and local prefectures. Table 4 below provides a breakdown of the key demographics of the sample.

Table 4. Rank, length of service and basic training.

Type of training	Dir (1)	Dep Dir (1)	Ch. Comm (5)	Comm (10)	Ch.Insp (14)	Insp (4)	Unkown (1)
Militia	1	1	3	6	3		
Tallinn police			1	3	6	2	
Paikuse Police School					1		
None			1	1	3	2	
Years of service							
0-5					3		1
6-10			2	4	9	3	
11-15			2	3	1		
16-20			1	1			
21-25		1		1	1		
25-30	1			1			
30 +							

The sample data illustrates that there is a reliance on Soviet Militia trained officers in the higher ranks, together with a significant proportion with no basic police training. Officers had a considerable degree of respect for militia training, with many of the view that it was an appropriate and good form of basic police training. It was seen as particularly useful on surveillance techniques and scene-of-crime work.

In terms of courses training course attended, there was a wide variation: the 5 Chief Commissars attended a total of 24 courses between them with a range of 3 to 8. The Commissars (10) attended a total of 25 courses, the range 1–5. The 14 Chief Inspectors attended 41 courses between them, range 1–5. The Inspectors had received a total of 6 courses, range 1–4. The Director of the Criminal Police attended 4 and the Deputy Director 7. Table 5 describes the main courses represented by the Interview sample.

Table 5. Course sample – interview sample.

Year	Course	Number of officers
1995	International Law Enforcement Academy (ILEA) 8wk basic	5
1996	ILEA 8wk basic	3
1997	ILEA 8wk basic	5
1997	Financial police (money laundering) FBI	3
1996	Supervisory officers Strathclyde police	2
1997	Supervisory officers/specialists Strathclyde	3
1996	Supervising officers Finland	3
1996	County/City Prefects Finland	4
1997	Traffic police (motorcycle) Finland	3
1997	Traffic police (car) Finland	4
1997	SWAT/Criminal police/ FBI	4

Respondents were asked about their experience of international training programs. A large proportion reflected positively on their training experiences; they commented that they had learnt a significant amount in a short period during training events. On further probing by the researcher, it was however often difficult for respondents to articulate or define exactly what they had learnt; this may of course be due to the ready assimilation and integration of such policing techniques into their everyday practice. Many respondents commented that the inter-

national contacts they made had proved useful, one respondent who had undertaken training in Germany noted:

“The German training was very good. It was interesting to make comparisons, as there were participants from different countries. There was a good exchange of ideas and views.” (Respondent 4).

A frequent theme in relation to the value of training was that ‘any course’ is valuable. If a course was considered to be well prepared and high in participation then this was viewed as ‘value-added’ and a bonus, rather than as a prerequisite of good practice in training programs. On probing, this attitude that any external training is worthwhile may reflect a deeper view that participating in such programs is itself symbolic of having been admitted to the western law enforcement community. It no doubt also reflects the downward pressure to accept as much external donor aid as possible. However, this pressure did seem of itself to create a modicum of confusion and resentment among those attending programs. Some respondents considered that they were being taught, on occasions, what they already knew:

“There were some practical techniques – taking fingerprints – which I already knew.” (Respondent 4).

Another respondent commented that time spent at the International Law Enforcement Academy (ILEA) had not been as beneficial as he had hoped:

“The lectures were too trivial. The level was too low, I expected a higher level of input.” (Respondent 12).

Apart from these somewhat negative comments in relation to the depth of coverage, there were a number of our sample who were more than satisfied with the courses they attended, one noted:

“I have no criticisms. I received a lot of new knowledge and gained confidence in myself.” (Respondent 18).

This respondent was based in a rural region of Estonia and the comment referred to his experience of a management training course organised and delivered by Strathclyde police (UK). He could see immediate benefits in terms of incorporating his learning into day-to-day practice of managing officers in his prefecture. He added that the leadership course had given him:

“...my first experience of a scientific approach to management. I now pay more attention to planning and analysis. I also pay more attention to individual work with people.” (Respondent 18).

This respondent in common with others commented on the need for foreign experts to understand not only the general issues that affect all transition states, but need also to know more about the specific local context of policework in Estonia. The perceived failure of some international programs to understand the Estonian context was a frequent theme. Although this point was made broadly, it most often arose in relation to assistance programs from the USA. For example, one respondent referring to a period at ILEA said:

“I did not hear anything useful. It was not valuable as the legislation is very different: so there was practically no applicable knowledge.” (Respondent 8).

Another respondent stated:

“The people who arrange the courses talk about how they are working within their own policing and legislative environment...” (Respondent 20).

Nevertheless, this respondent, who had completed programs both in Estonia and the USA on a range of topics was positive in his overall evaluation of training received. Another respondent was more generally critical of courses offered:

“I’ve nothing to learn from these courses. Many courses are of little use – they only teach us to reinvent the bicycle. Courses should be tailored to a defined local need.” (Respondent 26).

Dissatisfaction with some of the US courses in particular is summed up aptly by this respondent:

“In the case of the Americans, they always show how they do things in the US of A and try to influence others. But the legislative and cultural base is different. In Scotland, they were not so patronising. They did not expect us to take things over as a given package.” (Respondent 10).

This is resonant with another comment, *“They should train us about ‘future crimes’. They assume we don’t know anything; its offensive to be taught what you already know.”* (Respondent 33).

The criticisms of the USA are revealing in so much as the absolute proportion of assistance across federal agencies is very high and also in that the sense of ‘admittance to the international club of law enforcement’ is underwritten by association with US law enforcement. In addition, the USA provides considerable opportunities for travel and extending the horizons of officers. Consequently, considerable heightened self-esteem is gained from association with US police, but there remains residual scepticism as to motive and a sense that they (US officers) do not fully understand the policing environment in Estonia.

Yet for other respondents this scepticism was far removed, and they considered these ‘weaknesses’ to be rather ‘strengths-in-disguise’. They greatly enjoyed the comparative dimension, which raised new ways of thinking:

“Courses are organised (by Americans) on topics that are new to us. Economic crimes are an example; there is a new system and the investigation techniques are different.” (Respondent 31).

However, the sense of having a training program self-imposed, where trainers have little knowledge was seen as a common occurrence. As one high ranking respondent commented:

“Trainers tell us how things are done in their country. They do not understand the situation here in Estonia. I agree with the Director General of the Latvian Police when he says that trainers should visit us beforehand. We are not always able to benefit from or implement training because the organisational

structures are different, there are different communities with different principles.” (Respondent 34).

Taking account of existing (baseline) experience and shaping a training package which appears to value previous training is a difficult part of the training enterprise and process. A difficulty, no doubt further complicated by language and cultural issues. In spite of this, courses by US colleagues are highly valued and many respondents referred to the personal contacts with American colleagues as long-lasting and immensely beneficial in personal terms.

In relation to courses provided by neighbours or those in the ‘near by region’ the sense of satisfaction appear higher. Strathclyde’s courses were viewed both as relevant to the needs of participants and very well organised; the same view was taken of the Finnish contribution – relevant, well organised and well delivered. One respondent who attended a Nordic-Baltic Police Academy course commented:

“I have no criticisms. The course has been very useful in my work in that I can now recognise forged documents and know when a car’s identification has been faked.” (Respondent 21).

The example of the Police Driving Course offered by Finnish police appears to meet with great endorsement as an exemplar of good training. The Finnish police provided a winter-driving course and invited police managers to participate. They trained not only police officers but also utilised these participants as trainers to train the trainers. These courses appear to have been very successful in reconceptualising police driver training in Estonia. However, while it is clear that the (Estonian) trainers are committed to such courses, they raised the issue of the lack of endorsement of the courses by police managers:

“The biggest problem is to get local managers to understand the necessity of good driving skills. Local prefects think that there is no need for training, their officers know how to drive. Our courses are designed for experienced drivers and sometimes they (local prefects) sent beginners.” (Respondent 32).

Relevance of training was also a recurring theme in the interviews. It is apparent that some courses are not seen as relevant – or at least not a priority matter for Estonian police at this stage in their development. For example, a number of respondents had attended courses on ‘money-laundering’. Given that Estonia at that time (1996) had no legislative provisions against money laundering this was perceived to have been an ill-judged course.

“I attended a course on money laundering. Estonia has no law..the course was interesting but of no immediate significant value.” (Respondent 34).

This seems to be an illustration of the donor’s perspective and concern about transnational issues – namely the threat posed by transnational organised crime in the Baltic region. Perhaps more generously, it can be viewed as capacity building in mutual interests.

Generally, the majority of respondents valued the training assistance that they had received. Interestingly, they had little or no knowledge as to how they were selected:

“I do not know why I was selected. I do not know why people are selected or the criteria for specific courses. There is no information on course details or on who acts as the ‘selector’.” (Respondent 29). Another commented:

“On selection, frankly I do not know, there appears to be varying criteria in different cases.” (Respondent 31). Yet another noted:

“The courses I participated in were open to volunteers. Interesting courses outside of Estonia are a mystery as to how to get onto....depends on your relationship with the bosses.” (Respondent 33).

Of course, in relation to foreign programs, competence in English is one clear factor; but several fluent speakers had no insight into why they had not been selected for Quantico (FBI) or other US locations.

Respondents were asked how much information they had received prior to the course. The comments broadly reflected results from our questionnaire. In relation to the USA, there appears to have been a lack of planned pre-prepared course material and this was, for some officers, a real drawback. Where materials had been made available in advance, respondents were highly positive about their quality. An officer commenting on a Strathclyde course said:

“I received information about the course and that information was excellent.” (Respondent 13). Another stated that:

“I received no prior information; I just turned up. In principle I know the aims and objectives of the course....” (Respondent 17). One respondent, having attended two regionally organised courses opined that:

“There was no information – just the subject title, nothing about the course prior to going.” (Respondent 21).

These comments are typical of the experience of participants in that they appear to receive little in the way of information; yet this does not seem to have adversely affected their judgement on the overall evaluation of international assistance training. Along with the lack of pre-course material, there was also not surprisingly no foreknowledge of likely course aims and objectives. Nor were the majority of respondents able to recall formal evaluation sheets being administered. Finally, only a tiny proportion of respondents received feedback on completed evaluation sheets.

Some broad conclusions from the interview data would be appropriate here. In policy terms, as one senior officer remarked, there is no question but that international assistance is vital in the successful future development of policing policy:

“When policymakers come together they reflect on their (Scottish) training. There are different subjects which participants recall which assists them to use the courses to consider policy choices. The courses assist in such policymaking and things will be implemented in time.” (Respondent 35).

Training is generally highly valued by Estonian police officers; officers experience the training process as good regardless of the content. Expectations are not high in respect of a course's structure, provisions of material and evaluation of stated aims. Rather all of this is seen as 'value-added', a bonus. Personal contact with officers from overseas police environments is viewed as an important determinant of the 'success' of a training program. The ability to develop links through training and to network serves to enhance personal and professional self-esteem; this is a not unimportant outcome in a country where policing has little public esteem and where throughout the 1990s salaries have been low.

For all the positive evaluation, there was also a sense of critical appreciation; a frustration that they had not been admitted to the training as equals or at least full members of the 'law enforcement community'. They often felt insecure during training, lacking management support. The failure of some trainers to have even rudimentary knowledge of Estonian institutions and the period during and since Soviet annexation was an irritant for many- it was as though what had happened during the Soviet period could not possibly be viewed as 'good' or 'valid' policework. These perceptions tended to be more focussed on US training courses (although not exclusively so). A final theme, mentioned previously in this section, is the view that any future training assistance should take account of the already existing levels of skill and knowledge of those participating:

"Trainers should have an overview (supplied by Estonian management) of the participants. There should be careful selection, and courses should be graded with a level of difficulty and a statement of prerequisites about knowledge and skills. So, courses should in this way assist development of real practical policework." (Respondent 9).

Main Findings

From the analysis of the questionnaire results and interview data, we would summarise the key findings as follows

- The largest share of training places in the period 1993–1997 were provided by the USA (37 %).
- 15 % of all training places during the period were located outside of Estonia, with the USA, Finland and the UK providing around two-thirds (or just over 66%) of these externally based training places.
- The USA appear (as of 1998) to have a trajectory of training courses that can be described as 'more of the same'. Finnish assistance is expanding into new areas, particularly economic and financial policing. Other donors are emerging, for example the Netherlands and Germany, as indeed others disappear (the UK).
- While the majority of officers know why they are selected for training and considered that the training was relevant to their current policework, a sizeable minority had no knowledge of the selection criteria (or indeed if there were any).

- Just under 75 % of officers considered that the course(s) attended were relevant to their job and that it developed professional knowledge considerably.
- In general there was a good measure of satisfaction with existing training courses. However, interview data highlighted a number of areas where officers considered courses could be improved. Particular attention, it was argued, should be paid to some assessment of existing knowledge and skills of participants.
- There was a significant degree of irritation with the lack of local contextual knowledge by some trainers (in the main this criticism applied to the USA).
- There was good evidence supplied by interviewees that many examples exist of assimilation of training into everyday routines.
- The case for the relevance of some courses related to transnational organised crime needs to be made more explicit; only in this way can such courses be seen as developmental and as a specific form of capacity building by the recipients.
- The overall judgement by participants on the 'value' of international assistance training programs is multidetermined; in addition to formal assessment, our data points to a range of reasons which include contact with officers from different (more prestigious) policing environments, development of professional self-esteem and status.
- It was widely accepted that assistance training could only be optimally effective within a police organisation, which fully identified corporate training needs and could identify the training requirements of individual members of staff. It was almost universally felt that this was not the case at the present time in the Estonian police organisation.
- There is evidence of some duplication of training provision; this is seen by interviewees as an inevitable feature of both a lack of organisational training strategy within the Estonian police and the problem of no external coordinating agency to 'handle' international training assistance.

4 Phase Three results

As an important contribution to understanding the *process* of assistance in training, our research proposal outlined a third phase of the project, where the researchers would observe the ‘real time’ delivery of a selected number of training courses. The rationale for this was set out in an earlier section of the report: essentially, it allows the researcher to examine in detail, via interviews with trainer-donors, the process from inception to delivery. It provides an insight into how the training assistance is conceptualised and actually delivered by donors—both strategically and tactically.

Our selection of three courses was partly determined by specific issues revealed in our analysis of Phase Two results and partly by the logistical constraint of international assistance timetabling through the lifetime of the project. After appropriate consultations, the training programs selected were:

- ‘**Witness Protection and Organised Crime**’ provided via the FBI (USA)
- ‘**Advanced Winter Driving Skills for Police Officers**’ provided by the Finnish police (Finland)
- ‘**Police Tactics and Safety at Work for Police Officers**’ provided by the Finnish police (Nordic Baltic Police Academy).

All three used, to varying degrees, interpreters with Russian as a common language in the regional courses.

The methodological approach involved setting pre-agreed active 30 minute observation periods appropriate to the length of course and throughout the course delivery; semi-structured interviews with participants throughout the period of course delivery; semi-structured interviews with trainers throughout delivery; semi-structured interviews with the liaison officer for training. The interview protocol for trainers covered five broad areas

- strategic planning and precourse information
- selection issues
- practical arrangements
- expectations
- knowledge of local context

For analysis purposes, observation fieldnotes were compared between the two researchers and the contemporaneous interview notes were analysed using agreed themes. We used a traditional process sequence in drawing conclusions about the training program (see Bartram 1999 for details). The sequence can be set out as follows:

TRAINING NEEDS ANALYSIS – TRAINING NEEDS PROCESS-
TRAINING METHODS – TRAINING DESIGN – FEEDBACK-INVOLVE-
MENT – EVALUATION.

Witness Protection and Organised Crime Course

This course took place over three days in December 1998 at a government conference centre outside Riga, Latvia. It had participants from all three Baltic states of Estonia, Latvia and Lithuania (10 from each) and was under the auspices of the Federal Bureau of Investigation (USA). Training was delivered by a combination of a US District Attorney, an FBI Special Agent, and a US Marshal. The training course was also attended by the training liaison officer. All three were US based practitioners, with only the US Marshal having had substantial training and instruction experience. The aim of the course was to provide participants with the background and operational details of the US Witness Protection Program and to do so in the context of organised crime by:

- reviewing the key issues of internal witness management, ranging from access to support services to basic investigation management.
- demonstrating the importance of effort being made in risk assessment.
- even in minor cases, at each stage of an internal case.
- reviewing the central role of middle managers in any support strategy.
- using three particular cases in which the above processes can be illustrated.

None of the trainers had any experience of delivering courses in the Baltic states. For two of the three, this was their first experience of travel to the Baltic region. Arrangements for practical arrangements, including interpreters and location for the training course were left to the Latvian authorities. Prior to commencement of the opening training session, it was clear that the physical arrangements of room layout for the interpreters meant that they were unable to read (and thus translate) overhead transparencies and slides shown to the participants. This issue was not adequately resolved, even by the end of the course.

At the opening session the proposed details of the course on the Witness Protection Program were outlined: first, the rationale (a) one part of the solution to getting witnesses to testify against organised crime (b) an important and effective investigative and prosecution aid in securing the cooperation and testimony against organised crime; second a review of the US legal basis; third agency roles – Department of Justice, US Marshal's service, District Attorney, FBI agent and the witness; finally, a description of the elements of the Program, namely geographic relocation and danger areas of familial contacts, new identity and related issues of employment, subsistence and the goal of self-sufficiency. There was some consternation that the emphasis appeared overly related simply to the experience of US police professionals. This tension remained throughout the duration of the course.

On trainers' perceptions of training needs analysis, we can summarise it in the following way:

- there was a lack of clarity on what part of overall police organisation plans the training had set out to tackle.
- a good level of clarity on specific objectives.
- almost no understanding of the background to funding of this training program.
- an adequate understanding of methods used to gather evaluation information.

- a good level of understanding of the key people involved in the process of assistance liaison and organisation.

On participants' perceptions of needs analysis, we can summarise findings as follows:

- all participants knew why they were attending this particular course.
- few participants knew about the likely content of the training.
- only a small proportion of participants felt that they had been meaningfully involved in identifying their own current knowledge, understanding and skills in the aspects to be covered by the training.
- few of those interviewed knew how taking part in this training would assist in their particular job.
- no participants felt that they had sufficient advance information to be able to decide which parts would be most beneficial.
- only a minority of participants knew what to expect from the training, what they would learn and how to apply it to everyday policework.
- few participants knew what their immediate line management expected of them as a result of attending this assistance training.

On training design we can conclude that:

- although a significant proportion of the design (content, methods, timings and sequence) linked back to the course aim and objectives, these aims and objectives were somewhat fragmented.
- there was no clear evidence that methods for evaluation were designed alongside content.
- the opening session related only obliquely to the participants' learning needs and took little account of the context of local policing in the Baltic states.
- the practical illustrations were well organised in a logical sequence for learning. The learning was split into definite manageable units, throughout the entire period of training.
- the case studies were designed to reflect the complexities of this area of US operational policework and the interaction with the wider criminal justice system. Participants found these cases too detailed for their learning needs.
- there was only limited attention given by the design to how police officers learn best and no graded response to match as far as possible different levels of experience and learning styles.
- the organisation of the sessions was problematic in respect of environmental factors such as room use and other practical arrangements.
- the amount of content was not realistic for the time available.
- there was sufficient time for participants to practice what had been taught.
- there was appropriate time allocated for feedback to participants, although the effectiveness of this was diluted because of weak chairing of the feedback sessions.
- there were adequate and well-spaced opportunities for progress checks over the extended time of the course. This was a very positive feature of the course design.

- the language used was clear and accessible at all levels of experience. A minority of participants commented on the use of technical acronyms without full explanation. Participants found the use of humour in presentation by the trainers highly effective in increasing their interest.
- there was no effective anticipation of potential problems (given the location for the training): for example in relation to room layout and catering issues.
- there was a useful summary that drew together key learning points from the content and the participants.
- there was limited time for extended evaluation, but a very useful questionnaire was utilised at the end of the course.

Several elements of the course were highlighted by participants as being exceptionally problematic: first, the lack of understanding by the trainers of the local context in the Baltic region; more especially the legal position of using witness schemes in the different Baltic states and the impact of social, cultural and geographical constraints on the use of ‘classic’ relocation measures in small states. Second, the lack of opportunity to ‘compare and contrast’ and to generalise from the principles implicit in the course delivery. Thirdly, what was seen as an over simplistic and inappropriate conception of the character of organised criminality in their region.

Despite the difficulties encountered at several stages, course delivery did not suffer and participants were very positive about the value of the course for ‘making them think’ about organised crime in the Baltics. In addition, participants found the learning environment created by the trainers to be conducive to good interaction amongst their colleagues. This was said to be have been lacking in other courses attended by some.

Advanced Driving Skills for Police Officers Course

The course took place over 3 days in February 1999 at the Finnish winter driving establishment in Pieksämäki, central Finland. It had participants from all three Baltic states of Estonia, Latvia and Lithuania (8 from each) and was under the auspices of the Finnish police. Training was delivered by two trainers from the Finnish police training school in Tampere, Finland. The aim of the course is to provide participants with knowledge and practical skills on winter driving techniques by:

- a review of the science and theory behind police practice in car handling.
- providing a series of graded driving exercises.
- setting best practice through individual tuition.

The course was led by two very experienced driving instructors, and it was evident that the reputation of the course was known to all participants. The opening plenary session provided participants with pre-prepared written materials on the driver/vehicle relationship: including, the physical dynamics of general driving and braking and how the laws of vehicle dynamics are applied to allow vehicle control at above normal highway speeds. The key ethic of ‘responsible’ driving

was emphasised throughout this opening session and formed the key theme of the entire course both the theory and practical elements. The design of the course was such that one third was classroom based and two thirds behind-the-wheel. The practical behind-the-wheel training was acknowledged to be of a very high standard. The lecture-practical sequence proved to be highly effective in developing coherent learning strategies. Participants practised alongside instructors and there was also 'co-driving' with other participants.

On trainers' perceptions of training needs analysis, we can summarise it in the following way:

- there was a substantial clarity on what part of overall police organisation plans the training had set out to tackle.
- a good level of clarity on specific objectives.
- a modest understanding of the background to funding of this training program.
- an adequate understanding of methods used to gather evaluation information.
- a good level of understanding of the key people involved in the process of assistance liaison and organisation.

On participants' perceptions of needs analysis, we can summarise findings as follows:

- all participants knew why they were attending this particular course.
- all participants knew about the likely content of the training through well constructed advance publicity.
- a significant proportion felt that they had been meaningfully involved in identifying their own current knowledge, understanding and skills in the aspects to be covered by the training.
- over three quarters of those interviewed knew how taking part in this training would assist in their particular job.
- a smaller number felt that they had sufficient advance information to be able to decide which parts would be most beneficial.
- around three quarters knew what to expect from the training, what they would learn and how to apply it to everyday policework.
- all participants knew what their immediate line management expected of them as a result of attending this assistance training.

On training design we can conclude that:

- a significant proportion of the design (content, methods, timings and sequence) linked back to the course aim and objectives.
- there was clear evidence that methods for evaluation were designed alongside content.
- the opening session related the learning to the learners needs and to the context of the local police driving environment in the Baltic states.
- the practical driving activities were organised in a logical sequence for learning. The learning was split into definite manageable units, throughout the entire period of training.
- the practical driving activities were designed to reflect how police officers learn best and there were graded driving activities to match, as far as possible, different levels of experience and learning styles.

- the organisation of the sessions was sympathetic to environmental factors such as room use and outside weather conditions.
- the amount of content was realistic for the time available.
- there was sufficient time for participants to practice what had been taught.
- there was appropriate time allocated for feedback to participants.
- there were adequate and well-spaced opportunities for progress checks over the extended time of the course.
- the language used was clear and accessible at all levels of experience.
- there was excellent anticipation of potential problems (given the location for the training): for example back up car equipment, removal and spares, together with catering issues.
- there was a highly valuable summary that drew together key learning points from the content and the participants.
- time for extended evaluation was built in.

Several elements of the practical course were highlighted by participants as being exceptional: skid control and spin recovery, understanding understeer and oversteer, and how they are controlled; advanced emergency threshold braking. Other aspects were seen to illustrate direct classroom learning objectives: these included understanding multiple vehicle dynamics, braking in curves and swerving-to-avoid obstacles; how to drive safely at night considering limited visibility and ‘oncoming’ light problems. The classroom facilities were not in close proximity to the driving area and thus continuous instruction was not possible. Some participants saw this as a deficiency in planned delivery.

Police Tactics and Safety at Work Course

The course took place over a 5 day period in October 1999 at a police training establishment in Vilnius, Lithuania. It had participants from all three Baltic states of Estonia, Latvia and Lithuania (10 from each) and had been organised under the auspices of the Nordic Baltic Police Academy. Training was delivered by two trainers from the Finnish Police Training School in Tampere, Finland. The training liaison officer (also a Finnish officer) was in attendance throughout.

The aim of this course is to provide participants with the skills to develop police tactics, the police organisation and activities by:

- reviewing the key principles of police tactics and leadership.
- emphasising the service aspects of policing.
- reviewing the responsibilities of supervisory officers for developing safety issues.
- reviewing principles of organisational development.
- setting the ethics of policing.
- reviewing the importance of planning.
- reviewing the system of models of police planning and setting objectives.

This course was led by two highly experienced Finnish trainers: with more than forty years police experience between them, first as field officers and then more

recently as trainers at Tampere Police School. The importance and practicality of what was to be learned was evident in an opening statement by one of the trainers:

“Police work is a profession of experience”.

In terms of strategic planning, there was clear evidence that the trainers had sought a picture of where the participants were now and where they were aiming for in terms of knowledge, understanding and skills. Throughout the 5 day course answers to the following questions were sought by the trainers either during formal sessions or informally at recreation breaks:

- did we train the right people?
- were the methods we selected the most appropriate?
- did we design the best content to meet our objectives?
- was the training delivered in an effective way?
- to what extent have people learned from the training?
- do people’s perceptions of the training support this?

The delivery of the course content was very well organised. All participants were given a Field Notebook, which contained notes, specific exercises to be completed and space for any further notes. Participants commented on the value of this and how and in what ways they intended to use this as a resource to inform other colleagues in the police service. The course began with a plenary discussion of the proposed topics, together with a ‘co-instructor’ role for some of the more experienced participants present. Question and answer sessions followed each substantive session. The session on non-verbal communication used video and well constructed and informative overhead transparencies. This session was particularly noteworthy in demonstrating the way in which the participants clearly felt co-equals; contributing to a lively discussion about police body language and cultural expectations that were, it was argued, a relic of the Soviet era of policing.

On trainers’ perceptions of training needs analysis, we can summarise it in the following way:

- there was a good degree of clarity on what part of overall police organisation plans the training had set out to tackle.
- good level of clarity on specific objectives.
- a good understanding of the background to funding of this training program.
- an adequate understanding of methods used to gather evaluation information.
- good level of understanding of the key people involved in the process of assistance liaison and organisation.

On participants’ perceptions of needs analysis, we can summarise findings as follows:

- most knew why they were attending this particular course.
- a substantial majority knew about the likely content of the training through well constructed advance publicity.
- only a small proportion felt that they had been meaningfully involved in identifying their own current knowledge, understanding and skills in the aspects to be covered by the training.

- about half of those interviewed knew how taking part in this training would assist in their particular job.
- a smaller number felt that they had sufficient advance information to be able to decide which parts would be most beneficial.
- around half knew what to expect from the training, what they would learn and how to apply it to everyday police work.
- only a small proportion of participants knew what their immediate line management expected of them as a result of attending this assistance training.

On training design we can conclude that:

- almost every aspect of the design (content, methods, timings and sequence) linked back to the course aim and objectives.
- there was clear evidence that methods for evaluation were designed alongside content.
- the opening session related the learning to the local context of policing.
- activities and exercises were organised in a logical sequence for learning; the learning was split into manageable chunks (for the most part).
- activities and exercises were designed to reflect how police officers learn best and there was a variety of activities to match as far as possible different levels of experience and learning styles.
- the organisation of the sessions was sympathetic to environmental factors such as room use and time of day.
- the amount of content was realistic for the time available.
- there was sufficient time for participants to practice what had been taught.
- there was appropriate time allocated for feedback to participants.
- there was insufficient time for progress checks over the extended time of the course.
- the language used was clear and accessible at all levels of experience.
- there was little in the way of anticipation of potential problems (given the location for the training): for example back up equipment, catering issues.
- there was a highly valuable summary that drew together key learning points from the content and the participants.
- time for evaluation was built in.

Evaluation was taken very seriously, and two substantial instruments (questionnaires) had been devised. The items covered assessment of satisfaction levels using Likert scales for general course content, theoretical and the practical balance, training materials, trainers qualifications. The questionnaires also sought active suggestions on course improvements, and likely benefits.

Our observational and interview notes lead to the view that ‘cooperation’ was the overriding concept that informed both the planning, delivery and evaluation of this highly successful course. The cooperation format worked well. It permitted also a wider unstated aim to be achieved – namely, to support police services in their endeavours to be professionally efficient and to perform their duties in accordance with what citizens expect of democratic policing methods, governed by the rule of law.

5 Discussion and conclusions

The type of research conducted here encountered, not surprisingly, a number of methodological problems. First, the Estonian police infrastructure on accounting for provision of programmes of assistance was lax in the early years; with the result that much was uncoordinated and not fully recorded. Accordingly, it was difficult to gain an entirely convincing assessment of what assistance had been forthcoming to the Estonian Police in these early years. On the appointment of Georg Maak in 1995 as the Senior Adviser, International Relations Section, to the Estonian State Police Board, there exists now a full record of assistance received in the period from 1995.

As usual there is also a battle of 'self-interest' at work in this international field. Donors are also, in part somewhat unforthcoming as to levels of assistance which has been provided over time. Therefore it is only possible to broadly estimate the level and type of assistance provided by the various sources of donation. In the case of the Estonian Police there has been considerable assistance from a variety of sources. Over the period of the research project assistance levels began to decline to individual Baltic States in that the Baltic States (Latvia, Lithuania and Estonia) were treated as a region rather than as separate countries. Consequently this relied on either **co-operation** between the three police forces, or, **competition** for scarce resources in relation to assistance. Due to this and special circumstances that existed in relation to Estonia there is no definitive record of assistance to Estonia. Consequently we were not able to gain a definite sense of the flow of assistance to Estonia over time and who the significant donors were in relation to assistance. There was also an understandable sense of defensiveness in relation to the Estonian Police inasmuch that they had been subject to a critical Council of Europe Report on their performance and management structure (Council of Europe 1997). Over-politicisation of the police was dealt with to some extent in 1999 by the agreement that the Director General of The Estonian State Police Board would be appointed for a five year term.

A second research problem was there was a lack of data in relation to what the situation was like prior to the instigation of the International Assistance Training Programs. Consequently we were not in a position to consider a simple 'before and after'. We had to rely on what respondents told us about their experiences prior to training. In respect of the research design, there was considerable negotiation that resulted in a number of compromises. Yet, we are sanguine enough to realise that this is more common than is usually admitted in the social scientific literature.

The third problem of note, and unanticipated, was that of interpretation – in that this is another filter between the researcher and the respondent. In analysing the data it is important to understand the contemporary context as well as the historical context of Estonia, especially when interviewing Russian speaking police officers.

In relation to the third phase of the research we were able to be more proactive in selecting the training courses we monitored in real time. However, we were of

course at the mercy of the timetable of assistance and the agreement of trainers and participants in allowing us to interview and observe the training process.

A Model of International Assistance

During the period of the research project we have been able to construct the following model of international assistance. It is based on our observations and direct interview data with both donors and recipients and it is our view that for any format of international assistance it is important that the model below is adhered to in order to aid communication, target resources and develop a joint and coherent strategy.

International assistance projects can only have any **real** and **lasting** benefits if they are the outcome of an inclusive partnership between donor and recipient countries. Assistance is a complex process and the delivery of assistance that neither recognises the complexity of the process nor values the cultural framework of the donor country will not deliver assistance that is of value or able to meet the aims and objectives of the assistance programme. The long term benefit of assistance is also complex, inasmuch that it is not simply, for example, just concerned with increasing the skill levels of the police officers receiving the training programme. For example, assistance in the area of traffic policing approaches this area at a number of different levels. It will address the issues of driving of police cars safely for *both* officer and public. The course will provide detailed skills teaching in stopping cars safely which are being pursued, it will also heighten officer awareness in relation to the tactics in approaching stopped cars in a safe manner. The Finnish 'Police Officer Driving Course', (previously described) also dealt with the issue of police officers wearing seat belts whilst on duty.

The above examples are of a practical nature. However, there is another level that is concerned with the development of police culture. We noted that there are different understandings of 'police culture' and the understandings are dependent upon who is providing the assistance. The concern with 'police culture' has a linkage to another level that is the target of assistance, that of assistance being involved in the building of democratically accountable institutions. However, it can be frustrating for donor countries to stand back and allow these institutions to develop and change over time in the recipient country. There were occasions when it was apparent during the period of this research that donor countries differ in their approach in relation to this issue. The only way in which these levels of assistance can be integrated and understood is through an active partnership between the donor and recipient with the donor being prepared to change their view and assistance based on the views and perspectives of the recipients.

It is our view that international assistance is bedevilled by pitfalls and these can be minimised by the following: consultation, inclusion, strategies of implementation and monitoring and evaluation. **Consultation** is imperative at the point of problem definition. The problematics of defining the problem should not be underestimated and donors should spend a considerable amount of time in

discussions with the recipients concerning the *dynamics* of the problem as well as the *territory* of the problem. In our experience the problems can be easily defined and agreed. For example, the need for both safe working practices and the enhancement of driving skills. But there is also a need to involve a range of different police officers in the process of problem identification. The officers involved should, in our view include operational officers, police service managers and policy makers. These different actors in defining the problem give it a dynamic and complexity that needs to be understood and engaged with by donors in order to ensure that the needs of the recipients are both properly defined and met. Unless these issues are fully explored with these various police professionals then it is possible that a core constituent group will either be missed out of the process completely or feel rebuffed by the assistance programme.

Inclusion of the central professional players in the practice area of the assistance programme is therefore crucial. *Practitioners* need to be brought into the consultation process early on, as they possess '*intimate*' knowledge of the problem and its dynamics. *Managers* need to be included as they possess the knowledge to consider the impact of implementation on practice and *policy makers* need to be included as they will need to consider the broader legislative framework and the implications of changes to working practices.

Strategies for implementation should be driven by a set of detailed aims and objectives. A failure to provide a set of aims and objectives of the assistance programme is problematic for at least two reasons. The assistance project might be dealing with a complex area of professional practice and become sidelined by what appear to be key professional issues. However, if the initial stage in relation to problem definition has been undertaken then it is possible that what appears to be a core issue might not be one of such importance as defined in the definition stage. Consequently, without a set of aims the project could easily be diverted onto less important issues. So, the aims provide a constant point of reference for those involved in the planning and delivery of the assistance project.

It was apparent from our interviews with participants, at all the training courses, that there was generally confusion about the aims of the various courses in which they were participating. Therefore a set of detailed aims and objectives would not only add clarity to the process of training, would also provide a means of being transparent about what is setting out to be achieved. A number of practitioners commented that they were concerned about having a form of practice imposed upon them. The sense of practices being imposed was important because sometimes officers commented that the lack of knowledge of trainers about local issues resulted in the trainers making unhelpful suggestions as how to implement some of the policing strategies contained in the training programme.

An important lesson for donor countries to heed is that policing practices that are considered 'every day' in the donor country are not taken as solutions to the problems identified in the recipient country(ies). The observations we undertook of the various training programmes reinforced this view, as we observed various approaches to problem solving the issues that confronted the various police forces receiving training. One approach was to structure the training in such a manner that it only provided knowledge about how it was done in the donor country. There was no attempt to analyse the 'policing skills' element of their

practice and transfer these to the recipients. The training was viewed by the trainers as 'providing knowledge', whereas for the recipients they wanted to be assisted in 'problem solving' issues in their police practice. The provision of knowledge position takes the view that police practice is easily transferred to the recipient country. This is in our view misguided because there is a lack of cultural specificity and a failure to take account of police practice in the recipient country.

There were very few explicit objectives contained in the training programmes. This, in our view, is a serious omission as objectives are important because they provide a means of *testing* whether learning has taken place and what has been learnt.

Finally, the *monitoring and evaluation* of assistance programmes are crucial. The effectiveness of the programme of assistance can only be demonstrated via its monitoring and evaluation outcomes. These need to be measured against the *aims* and *objectives* thus providing a clear indication of whether the aims were realistic and realisable. There has been, in our view, a lack of attention to the monitoring and evaluation arrangements of international assistance projects, with there being an over eagerness to provide assistance rather than a concern with attempting to find out if it is effective.

International assistance programmes must be sensitive to cultural diversity and the sensibilities of the recipient society. A failure to take account of these issues will not only be offensive but also result in the assistance programme being considered as being irrelevant and unhelpful to the recipient society. Finally, any form of assistance programme should leave a structure so that new practices can take place and develop. This necessitates a view in relation to both practice as carried out by practitioners and the implications for management. If the training programme does not put in place practice and management structures, forms of monitoring and evaluation and a future training strategy then it is doubtful whether the assistance can be considered to have been effective. The imparting of knowledge to a small number of people, who may have no power to influence future practice or structural developments, cannot be viewed as 'effective'. International assistance programmes should bequeath more than knowledge, they should leave behind structures which aid practice and strengthen democratic institutions and contribute to the development of an ethical society.

Table 6. A model of international assistance in training.

		Recipient	Recipient	Recipient	Donor	Donor
Stage	Area	Policy Maker	Manager	Practitioner	Policy Maker	Programme Delivery
Consultation	Problem Definition	X	X	X	X	
	Curriculum Design	X	X	X		X
	Programme Structure		X	X		X
Implementation	Cultural Sensitivity	X	X	X	X	X
	Training Strategy; eg. Training Trainers	X	X		X	X
	Future Strategy	X	X		X	
Delivery	Language	X		X	X	X
	Methods	X			X	X
	Timing	X	X		X	X
Monitoring & Evaluation	Participant Feedback. Course Completion	X	X	X	X	X
	Completion + 12 weeks	X	X	X	X	X
	Completion + 26 weeks	X	X	X	X	X
Training Strategy	Future Plans Agreed	X	X		X	
	Implementation Strategy Devised	X	X			
	Implementation	X	X			X

Problems & Difficulties in International Assistance

There are a number of problems and difficulties in the provision of assistance. These concern: police culture and conflict; police craft; policing strategy; police and politics; and police co-ordination and evaluation. In general each of these is concerned with the interaction between the donor and the recipient. These areas will be explored in more detail in this section of the report.

Police Culture and Conflict

This section refers to the difficulties that are encountered between the donor country and the recipient country. The culture conflict can be in relation to a number of areas, some of which are at the core of police practice and others that are more marginal. The more central the conflict to the core of police practice the more difficult it is to resolve. This has implications for the training process in that it is important for trainers to know how far to insist on a change of practice. To demand a change of practice may result in the alienation of the participant group and it could more significantly result in a rejection of the training approach by the participant group.

For example, in one of the training courses we observed there was a discussion and demonstration in relation to the use of firearms. The course was provided for all three Baltic States. It was apparent that the participants held different views as to the appropriate use of firearms; these views tended to conflict with those of the trainers. For some of the participants the use of firearms was an expression of the central role of police officers in society. The views of the trainers were that firearms are a 'last resort' in policing. So, there was conflict in relation to the most appropriate time to use firearms in policing, there was a view from some participants that they should be used at an earlier stage in the apprehension and arrest process.

The interaction between trainers and trainees raised a number of core policing value issues. This has a linkage to the provision of assistance in relation to the development of a police culture that does not take on the model of the Soviet Militia and at the same time is not a mirror image of a policing style commonly associated with the USA. Our observations concluded that police work, especially in the more dramatic and high profile police units, was constructed more in the image of popular television police fiction. An interesting question is how much has the exposure to American police television programmes defined, and constructed a view of, what it is to be a police officer in the Baltic States? We also observed a conflict between Western European police culture which is sceptical of the gun and a Central-Eastern European culture which is less hostile to gun use. It appeared that those officers who were in favour of more explicit use of guns had all received training in the USA and had been exposed to the USA police culture. This culture is significantly different in relation to the use of the gun in policing than that which prevails across Western Europe.

At least three factors need to be taken into account: first, a different culture of policework at the level of the recipient country where the experience of policing prior to 1992 was that of being policed by a militia. The second dynamic to this process of conflict is the westernisation of the media and how police structures and practices are drawn from fictional accounts and finally how the delivery of assistance itself creates confusion. This confusion is at two levels, the first within the recipient country's culture. This is where the period of transformation has resulted in a shift in police practice away from the old style militia policing to one that is more transparent and democratically accountable. However, this is fraught with problems of low pay and lack of strategic management, so that we were often informed that low levels of corruption are the norm. Second, having received training from a number of donors where the policing cultures are very different in relation to particular areas of police practice. This allows for an unstructured and a theoretical approach to policework to develop in the recipient country and core values and ethical principles can, and do, become compromised.

Police Craft & Strategy

The provision of assistance is concerned at one level with the development of police practice, or police craft. Therefore assistance programmes at one level focus on developing police practice. This was evident from a number of courses and comments made to us by respondents. For example one respondent commenting on training received said:

“It was interesting to make comparisons, as there were participants from different countries. There was a good exchange of ideas and views.” (Respondent 26)

This highlights the process whereby training provides opportunities for officers to make comparisons with policing practice in other countries. This process not only allows for links to be made and networks developed but also for the cross fertilisation of ideas and practices. However, as noted above, the cross fertilisation can create tension in that related training via different donors can result in contradictions concerning 'best practice' and the role of the police officer in society.

Another officer who had managerial responsibilities had gained knowledge relevant to management:

“..my first experience of a scientific approach to management. I now pay more attention to planning and analysis. I also pay more attention to individual work with people.” (Respondent 10)

This again demonstrates the integration of new modes of thinking and working into current practice. However, another respondent told us:

“I did not hear anything useful. It was not valuable as the legislation is very different; so there was practically no applicable knowledge.”
(Respondent 22)

This indicates that some officers did not consider the training to be relevant. The distance between the training topic area and the concerns and practices of the officer concerned were so far apart that it would be unlikely that he would integrate any new mode of working into his practice. The important issue in relation to this section is that some training courses were able to provide participants with a challenge to their current practice. This challenge provided new means of working, for example the ‘Police Tactics and Safety at Work’ training course provided by the Finnish Police was aimed at developing officers’ skills, for example how to make a ‘safe’ arrest or how to enter a room safely. Participants were able to immediately see the value of these police tactics and could relate the training to issues of safety. The course also provided time for officers to discuss different approaches and methods and to debate the positives and negatives of both their practice and that to which they were being introduced. Another feature of this course was also the opportunity that Finnish officers took in developing ‘policing culture’, the proper treatment of suspects, for example concern over their rights and so on.

The Driving Training Course provided a good example of strategic training. The participants ranged from those officers who had been trained as trainers, they were being provided with an opportunity to train others, those officers considering becoming trainers and police service managers, those who would need to release the potential trainers to train as trainers. The course was focused. The approach underlined the notion of the police as a profession – enhanced by a formal presentation of awards dinner on the final evening. The police officers were also encouraged again to consider issues of ethics in policing and to see policing by consent as a core value.

Police & Politics

The Council of Europe has produced a number of reports on policing in the Baltic States (see Council of Europe 1997). The report in relation to Estonia makes a number of observations concerning the role of politicians in policing. There is no doubt from our research and informed comments by police officers, police managers and others that this role by politicians was a significant issue.

The involvement of politicians in the appointment of the Director General has now been curbed and this should lead to greater stability. There are however, other issues, which need to be considered. There is also a politicisation of assistance. For example it was clear from comments by some officers, that some courses were of little relevance to their day to day police practice:

“I’ve nothing to learn from these courses. Many courses are of little use – they only teach us to reinvent the bicycle. Courses should be tailored to defined local need.” (Respondent 11)

In attempting to understand what is happening in relation to the provision of assistance it is clear that recipients agree to participate in courses for a number of reasons:

- assistance provides a level of contact.
- assistance provides an opportunity for higher ranking officers to meet.
- assistance potentially has economic benefits, either in the provision of ‘hardware’ or other training resources.
- assistance provides admission to the law enforcement community and in relation to EU accession it demonstrates ‘respectability’ in terms of policing practice.

However, it is also clear that a considerable amount of assistance is provided to meet political ends rather than that of developing police practice. Consequently not all the assistance is relevant or defined and ‘tailored to local need’. There are at least two consequences to this, first that recipient countries tend to take all offers of assistance regardless of content, topic or whether it meets the strategic aims of the police service. Second, because of this there is a lack of transparency in both receiving and donating assistance. There is also confusion, police officers receive different messages in relation to practice and consequently there is a risk of a contradictory police culture emerging, with officers behaving in potentially different ways. This indicates the lack of a coordinated and strategic implementation of assistance programs. In essence, it is important to understand how foreign policy contexts of both donor and recipient countries envelope assistance with competing and complementary notions of self-interests, goals and values.

Key Findings

The main project’s significant findings are listed below under the headings used in the ‘model of assistance’ outlined above: consultation; implementation; delivery; monitoring and evaluation; training strategy.

Consultation

The level and depth of consultation was variable across and within the programmes. Those programs which are established to meet a ‘skill deficit’, for example the ‘Driving Skills for Police Officers’ course appear to be founded on active consultation between recipient and donor both before and during the delivery of the program. This no doubt results from a greater likelihood of a shared understanding around the practical policing activity. Those programs that deal with perceived deficits in the broader policing curriculum have both the tendency to be donor driven and to lack the mutual understanding so easily achieved in practical activities.

Implementation & Delivery

The effectiveness of the organisation and delivery of the programs is crucially dependent on:

- a) *The international liaison officer's* perception of their role and task.
- b) The officers' degrees of freedom to operate under their own initiative.

So, the least successful Liaison Officer could be characterized as *'The Broker'* – in this case the task is seen as essentially a bureaucratic one of organising discrete events and programmes outwith any broader strategic aims and objectives.

In the hierarchy of success would then come *'The Diplomat'* – in this case the political process and sensitivities of assistance act to structure this officer's perception of role and task. Due to this objectives are often (deliberately) obscured and the practical oversight and delivery of the program is over shadowed by perceived requirements of both donor and recipient.

The most successful Liaison Officer type could be described as *'The Innovator'* – this officer is able to take the best characteristics of the 'Broker' and 'Diplomat', but also recognises the need, within a long term strategy, for effective oversight of monitoring and evaluation.

Monitoring & Evaluation

There was little evidence of an integrated approach to monitoring and evaluation. The most that can be inferred is of a loose feedback process. The limitations of that kind of approach are obvious. In particular the lack of assessment of longer term impact in the post-training period at twelve and twenty six weeks.

Training Strategy

In some cases it was difficult to assess how particular courses fitted within a broader training strategy agreed between donor and recipient. It could be argued that too much was left implicit in this respect. Relevance at the individual level was evidenced by participants on particular courses of being confused as to why they were participating and what relevance the course had to their police work. Participants on those courses which were part of an agreed integrated training strategy were clearer both in relation to the aims and objectives of the course and its relevance for their police work. Our observations tend to suggest that integrated training strategies are best devised and developed within the context of an accredited training school or similar institution.

Finally, the results of our project respectfully call for a recognition by the international community of the need for greater external coordination of international assistance in the field of law enforcement. Only in this way can there be some hope of avoiding duplication of effort and resources and the promotion of best use of available expertise.

6 Recommendations

The evidence from the case study has identified particular issues for donor and recipient countries and for specific project management in respect of international assistance. But a number of basic, more fundamental questions need to be answered. These questions include what does such assistance accomplish; does it utilise optimal strategies in methods of implementation; and how do these efforts relate to broader political objectives. Existing empirical studies, including our own, typically have a number of features that limit their utility in this regard. They may be undertaken during and immediately after an assistance period has finished, and therefore shed only light on the near term effects of assistance. Evaluations usually focus on specific operational issues and only rarely identify or question the assumptions embedded in the assistance programs concerning underlying intent, models of institutional transfer and so on. Another important dilemma is that of the ‘defensive culture’ that surrounds assistance; individuals in agencies directly involved in design and implementation are often steadfastly partisan advocates. To progress, any research framework needs to incorporate both distance and anonymity as mechanisms for developing a “deep understanding” of international assistance and co-operation. In this respect, we have three broad recommendations.

First, we recommend in the regional context, the establishment of an ad-hoc group, **A Baltic Working Group on International Assistance and Co-operation in Law Enforcement and Criminal Justice**, convened under the auspices of a major intergovernmental organization such as the United Nations or the Council of Europe. The group would:

- review the existing published literature on assistance, and indeed assistance reform (for example Berg 1997; more widely Bayley 2001), together with available evaluation reports.
- seek written evidence, take oral evidence and cross-examine representatives of relevant donor countries (Finland, UK and USA) and recipient countries (Estonia, Latvia & Lithuania) in the Baltic Region.

The Working Group would work to ‘Chatham House Rules’ which allows for unhindered discussion and non-attribution. Given the task it would seem appropriate that:

- membership would comprise representatives of appropriate government departments, policing and crime control agencies, The Nordic Baltic Police Academy, specialists in the disciplines of international relations, criminological evaluation and development studies.
- a time scale of eighteen months with one meeting in each of the Baltic States to allow for the taking of evidence and cross examination.
- the outcome would include provision of a draft report for circulation to donor and recipient countries followed by a final, agreed report to the appropriate UN committee and then for wider dissemination.

A **second recommendation** concerns the genuine need for donor countries jointly to sponsor **annual seminars on law enforcement assistance**, where aside from promoting knowledge of the general level of support being offered and the sharing of experience, there would be an opportunity to examine the known realities which shape both the proximal and the ultimate impact of any assistance. More specifically, such donor seminars would allow policymakers to enter an extended dialogue with criminologists and police researchers about the realities of police reform in given contexts; to date much assistance effort appears to show little awareness or relationship to such realities. Instead the organisational and personal dynamics so crucial to the world of the police are left, for the most part, unreflected upon. In their place, one sees only rhetorical tinkering and pious hope. Such seminars can aid our understanding and encourage reflection on how and in what ways assistance is embedded within cultural, organisational and political contexts, both local and international.

Not surprisingly, a **third** and final recommendation concerns **funding for future research**. It is essential that high-quality empirical research inform policy on the future development of international assistance. While it is true that knowing what might be done to improve the likely impact of international assistance is not the same as doing it, yet there is still much “to be known”. Simply put, it may be too early to incorporate existing knowledge into policy-action. We can finish on a pressing example: international assistance on the ground relies increasingly on international assistance ‘liaison’ officers. As a body of practitioners, they herald the development of a strange new ‘specialism’ which is being defined by its interstitial role and its interdisciplinary and political skills. At the same time, a new form of knowledge is being assembled which will support and extend this strategy. This new knowledge is growing up in the routines of institutional practice, developing in out of the way reports, ‘guides’ and conversations which receive little wider attention. This is but one important area that requires the immediate attention of the research community and that can assist all of us in developing a more informed approach to international assistance in law enforcement.

Bibliography

- Anderson, M. and den Boer, M. (1994) (eds.) *Policing Across National Boundaries* London: Pinter Press
- Anderson, M. (1997) 'Interpol and the developing system of international police cooperation' in McDonald, W. (ed.) *Crime and Law Enforcement in the Global Village* Cincinnati: Anderson Publishing
- Bartram, S. (1999) *Evaluating Training* Aldershot: Gower
- Bayley, D. (2001) *Democratizing the Police Abroad: What to Do and How to Do It*, Issues in International Crime Series June 2001 Washington D.C.: National Institute of Justice
- Berg, E. (1995) Some key issues in improving technical cooperation *International Journal of Technical Cooperation* 1(1): 29-38
- Carothers, T (1995) Democracy promotion under Clinton, *The Washington Quarterly*, 18 (4):13-25
- Clark, R. (1994) *The United Nations Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice Program* Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press
- Council of Europe (1997) *Report on the Police in Estonia* (Richardson, Launiainen/Roper) Strasbourg: Directorate of Legal Affairs
- Crawford, A. (1998) *The Local Governance of Crime: Appeals to Community and Partnerships* Oxford: Oxford University Press
- Davis, P. and Dombrowski, P. (2000) International assistance to the former Soviet Union: conditions and transitions *Policy Studies Journal* 28 (1): 68-95.
- Den Boer, M. (1995) *The practical value of Schengen for the police*, paper delivered to the conference 'Cooperation of police and justice administrations after Maastricht, Schengen and SIS', Trier Germany 21-22 September 1995
- Diamond, L. (1992) Promoting democracy, *Foreign Policy*, No87: 25-46
- EKI-TEST 1996/1997 Tallinn: Eesti Konjunkturiinstituut
- Hebenton, B. and Thomas, T. (1995) *Policing Europe: Cooperation, Conflict and Control* Basingstoke: Macmillan/St.Martins Press
- Hebenton, B and Thomas, T. (1998) Transnational policing networks *International Journal of Risk, Security and Crime Prevention* 3(2): 99-110
- Hebenton, B. and Thomas, T. (1999) Capacity building against transnational crime: European measures to combat sexual offenders *European Journal of Crime, Criminal Law and Criminal Justice* 7(2): 150-163
- Hebenton, B. and Spencer, J. (1994) The contribution and limitations of Anglo-American criminology to understanding crime in Central Eastern Europe *European Journal of Crime, Criminal Law and Criminal Justice* 2 (1) : 50-61
- Hebenton, B. and Spencer, J. (1996) *The Transference of Technology and Know-How in Crime Control: Reflections from Helsinki*. Paper presented at the 'Cross-Cultural and Comparative Criminology' Panel, Annual Meeting of the American Society of Criminology, Chicago, Illinois USA November 20-23 1996

- Hebenton, B. and Spencer, J. (1998) Law enforcement in societies in transition *European Journal of Crime, Criminal Law and Criminal Justice* 6(1): 29-40
- Ivkovic, S.K. and Haberfeld, M. (2000) Transformation from militia to police in Croatia and Poland *Policing: An International Journal of Police Strategies and Management* 23(2): 194-217
- Joutsen, M. (1996) *Managing International Technical Assistance Projects in Criminal Justice* HEUNI Paper No.8 Helsinki: HEUNI
- Karstedt, S. (2000) Knights of crime: the success of 'pre-modern' structures in the illegal economy in S. Karstedt and K-D Bussmann (eds.) *Social Dynamics of Crime and Control* Oxford: Hart Publishing Ltd
- Lauristin, M. (1997) Contexts of Transition in Lauristin, M. et al (eds.) (1997) *Return to the Western World: Cultural and Political Perspectives on the Estonian Post-Communist Transition* Tartu: Tartu University Press
- Lauristin, M. and P. Vihalemn (1997) Recent Historical Developments in Estonia: Three Stages of Transition (1987-1997) in Lauristin, M. et al (eds.) (1997) *Return to the Western World: Cultural and Political Perspectives on the Estonian Post-Communist Transition* Tartu: Tartu University Press
- Lehti, M. (1997) *Viron henkirikollisuus 1990-luvulla*. English summary: Homicides in Estonia in the 1990s. Publication, Helsinki: National Research Institute of Legal Policy
- Los, M. (1988) *Communist Ideology, Law and Crime* New York: St. Martin's Press
- Marenin, O. (1998a) From IPA to ILEA: change and continuity in US international police training programs *Police Quarterly* 1(4): 93-126
- Marenin, O. (1998b) US police assistance to emerging democracies *Policing and Society* 8(2): 153-167
- Marenin, O. (1998c) The goal of democracy in international police assistance programs *Policing: An International Journal of Police Strategies and Management* 21(1): 159-177
- Miles, D. (1998) Evaluating international development *Evaluation* 4(4): 469-482
- Nadelmann, E. (1993) *Cops Across Borders* University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press
- Nadelmann, E. (1997) 'The Americanization of global law enforcement: the diffusion of American tactics and personnel' in McDonald, W. (ed.) *Crime and Law Enforcement in the Global Village* Cincinnati: Anderson Publishing
- Polk, K. (1994) *When Men Kill* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Siemaszko, A. (1995) 'The Media and Crime' in Jasinski, J. and A. Siemaszko (eds.) *Crime Control in Poland* Warsaw: Ministry of Justice and Institute of Justice
- Spencer, J. and Hebenton, B. (1997) *Crime and Insecurity in the New Europe: Transitions in Security and Transitions to Democracy* Paper presented at the British Criminology Conference, Queen's University of Belfast, Belfast Northern Ireland July 1997

- Spencer, J. and Heberton, B. (2000) The privatization of crime control and social discipline in central and eastern Europe in Iatridis, D. (ed.) *Social Justice and the Welfare State in Central and Eastern Europe* Westport, Connecticut: Praeger Publishers
- Travis, J. (2000) Policing in transition *Police Practice and Research* 1(1): 31-39
- Varese, F. (1994) Is Sicily the future of Russia? Private protection and the rise of the Russian Mafia *Archives Europeennes de Sociologie* 35: 224-258
- Viljanen, T. (1997) *The HEUNI Database on International Projects in Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice in Central and Eastern Europe: Experiences with the First Two Years of Operation* Helsinki: HEUNI
- UNDP (United Nations Development Programme) (1997) *Estonian Human Development Report 1997* Tallinn: UNDP

Appendix one

List of respondents interviewed in Phase One

(during the period January 1997 – December 1997)

Maak, G. Mr. Senior Adviser, International Relations Section,
Estonian State Police

Lipstok, Mr. Head of International Relations Section, Estonian State Police

Kaup, R. Ms. & Vainsalu, U. Mr. Leading police inspectors, Juvenile Policing
Section, Estonian State Police

Jundas, K. Ms. Deputy Director of Central Investigation Bureau

Anvelt, A. Mr. Commissar, Central Criminal Police

Jarvekulg, K. Mr. Assistant Police Prefect, Tallinn Police Prefecture

Savimaa, R. Mr. Head of Department of Communications, Estonian State Police

Konts, H. Ms. Assistant Adviser, Public Relations, Estonian State Police

Merits, J. Mr. Director, Paikuse Politseikool, Parnu

Kumm, Mr. Assistant Police Prefect, Parnu Police Prefecture
Forensic Division Parnu Police Prefecture

Moschella, W. Mr. FBI Legal Attache US Embassy, and Mark Jameson FBI

O'Neill, K. Mr. Regional Security Officer, US Embassy

Berenbson, R. Mr. journalist Eesti Paevaleht

Kagge, R. Mr. journalist Postimees

Loit, U. Mr. Estonian Broadcasting Association

Laurendt, A. Ms. Ministry of Justice

Markus, I. Ms. Ministry of Justice

Ahven, A. Mr. Ministry of Internal Affairs

Vickers, D. Mr. Chief of Mission & Know How Fund, British Embassy Tallinn

Mandmaa, M. Ms. Ministry of Justice, Criminal Law Department Probation
Division

Keskula, L. Ms. Director, Estonian Translation and Legislative Support Centre

Jukham, R. Mr. Programme Adviser UNDP, Tallinn

Leps, A. Dr. Member of Parliament Riigikogu

Kelder, P. Mr. Vice Chancellor Ministry of Internal Affairs

Kell, K. Ms. Deputy Head of Information Department, Bank of Estonia

Ruutsoo, R. Dr. Senior Scholar, Institute of International and Social Studies,
Tallinn Pedagogikal University and Nikula, J. Mr. Helsinki University Finland

Publications and sources consulted 1996–1998

- Estonian Human Development Report 1997* (1997) Tallinn: UNDP Internet version available at <http://www.ciesin.ee/undp/nhdr.html>
- Aimre, I. (1996) *The Sense of Security and the Evaluations of Police Activities* Tallinn: Estonian National Defence and Public Service Academy
- Aromaa, K. and A. Ahven (1995) *Victims of Crime in a Time of Change: Estonia 1993 and 1995* National Research Institute of Legal Policy Research Communications No.16
- Aromaa, K. (1998) *The International (Crime) Victimisation Survey in Finland, Estonia, Latvia and Lithuania 1995-1997*. In K. Aromaa (ed.) *The Baltic Region. Insights in crime and crime control. Scandinavian Studies in Criminology Vol. 15*. Oslo: Scandinavian Research Council for Criminology/Pax Forlag A/S, 82-103
- Blom, R. (ed.) (1996) *Regulation and Institutionalization in the Baltic States Research Reports Series A: 27/1996* Department of Sociology and Social Psychology, University of Tampere, Finland
- Blom, R. , Melin, H. & Nikula, J. (eds.) (1996) *Material for Baltic Models of Transformation National Reports Working Papers Series B:36/1996* Department of Sociology and Social Psychology, University of Tampere, Finland
- Blom, R. (ed.) (1997) *Expert Interviews from the Baltic States Working Papers Series B: 37/1997*, Department of Sociology and Social Psychology, University of Tampere, Finland
- Falck, S. (1998) *Juvenile Delinquency in a Society in Transition: Report on Estonia*. In K. Aromaa (ed.) *The Baltic Region. Insights in crime and crime control. Scandinavian Studies in Criminology Vol. 15*. Oslo: Scandinavian Research Council for Criminology/Pax Forlag A/S, 16-50
- Kaarid, L. & R. Juhkam (eds.) (1997) *Integrating Non-Estonians Into Estonian Society: Setting the Course* Tallinn: UNDP
- Lehti, M. (1998) *Recent Crime Trends in Eastern Europe*. In K. Aromaa (ed.) *The Baltic Region. Insights in crime and crime control. Scandinavian Studies in Criminology Vol. 15*. Oslo: Scandinavian Research Council for Criminology/Pax Forlag A/S, 51-81
- Leps, A. (1997) *Organised Crime in Estonia: Cross Road of International Organised Crime in Organised Crime in the Baltic Region, Collected Articles* Riga: Criminological Research Centre
- Leps, A. (1996) *Organised Crime in Estonia: Its Historical Preconditions* *European Journal on Criminal Policy and Research* vol 5 (1): 82-87
- Leps, A. & M. Remmel (1996) *Crime and Income Distribution in Estonia in Crime and Criminology at the End of the Century Proceedings of the IX Baltic Criminological Seminar 1996 May 22-25*, Tallinn: Estonian National Defence and Public Service Academy

Leps, A. (1994) Some Theoretical and Practical Problems Related to Crime in the Republic of Estonia Manuscript (unpublished)

Markina, A. (1998) *Organised Crime in Estonia: A National and International Issue*. In K. Aromaa (ed.) *The Baltic Region. Insights in crime and crime control. Scandinavian Studies in Criminology Vol. 15*. Oslo: Scandinavian Research Council for Criminology/Pax Forlag A/S, 183-194

Report of the Mission to Estonia, 19-20 September 1995 Helsinki: HEUNI

The Constitution of the Republic of Estonia (Estonian Legislation in Translation: Legal Acts of Estonia) January No.1 1996 Tallinn: Estonian Translation and Legislative Support Unit

Internet /electronic sources:

Eesti-Info <http://muhu.www.ee/> or <http://muhu.cs.Helsinki.fi/>

Open Estonia Foundation <http://www.oef.org.ee/>

Eesti Vabariigi Valitsus (The Government of the Republic of Estonia) <http://www.rk.ee>

Eesti Bank of Estonia <http://www.ee./epbe/>

The Baltics Online <http://www.viabalt.ee>

Institute of Baltic Studies <http://www.ibs.ee>

Concordia International University Estonia <http://www.ciue.edu.ee>

The Baltic Business Leader (via <http://www.ciue.edu.ee>)

Appendix three

The structure of the Estonian State Police

(during the lifetime of the project)

Director General _____	Advisers to State Police Board		
Crime Department	Law Enforcement Department	Legal Department	Central Secretariat
Criminal police	Field police	Personnel	Public relations
Central Investigation	Traffic police	Communications	Finance
Forensic science	Paikuse School		

The structure has a Director General (with Advisers) and four departments with particular responsibilities, and each with a Deputy Director General. The Prefect of Tallinn is also given the rank of Deputy Director General. Tallinn is one of 17 police Prefectures (areas) in Estonia.

Appendix four

International assistance audit

1993–4

UK (Strathclyde police)

- General management practice
- Personnel management
- Corporate approach to crime prevention
- Major crime investigation techniques
- Information technology seminar
- Force management systems
- Corporate approach to community relations
- Criminal investigation
- Traffic policing

1995–1997

Federal Republic of Germany

1 million DM dedicated for training purposes

- general police training
- criminal investigation
- specific crime investigation - economic/drug crime
- policing public order situations
- policing mass sporting events
- traffic policing

USA

- FBI organised crime and international car crime (Regional Baltic seminars)
- FBI, Basic police training course, ILEA Budapest
- FBI, White-collar crime
- DEA, International Drug Enforcement
- US Secret Service, Counterfeiting and financial crime
- Internal Revenue Service, fraud and embezzlement
- Diplomatic Security Service, passport and visa fraud
- ILEA, international law enforcement executive forum
- ILEA, forensic applications seminar
- ILEA, undercover investigative techniques seminar

- FBI agent training course (Quantico, Virginia)
- FBI forensics chemists' seminar (Virginia)
- FBI international enforcement seminar (Virginia)
- FBI international homicide investigators' symposium (St. Louis, Missouri)
- ILEA course for security police/border guard officers
- Financial economic crime course at Federal Law Enforcement Training Centre (Georgia, USA)
- FBI, basic training (Tartu officer) Quantico
- Computer crime seminar, New York Central Investigation Bureau staff

France

- moneylaundering/fraud training course
- Official visit, hosted by French Police Financial Division in Paris and Marseille

UK (Strathclyde Police)

- teaching techniques training course
- leadership training
- crime prevention course
- community relations course
- police management course

Nordic-Baltic Police Academy

- police management course
- sexual abuse and crimes against children course
- environmental offences course
- crime scene investigation course
- leadership and the media course
- educational theory and practice course
- crime investigation course
- police tactics course
- investigation of narcotics course
- crime prevention course

Finland

- drugs and drug enforcement
- disaster victim identification team
- Tallinn Police Chief, Tampere Police School and Helsinki Police

Netherlands

- scene of crime investigation

International assistance to the Estonian Police questionnaire to officers receiving training 1995–1997

PIN# _____

SECTION ONE

This section is concerned with your selection to the training course(s) you attended.

1. How did you know about the course ?
2. Why do you think you were selected to attend this course ?
 - a) I was selected because
 - b) I don't know why I was selected
3. How satisfied were you with advance notification of the timing and schedule of the course ?

Please circle

Not at all satisfied *Very satisfied*

1 2 3 4 5

4. Did you receive written course content information prior to attending ?

Please circle

YES

NO

DON'T KNOW

If YES then please answer question 5. If NO go to the next section.

5. How satisfied were you with this written information ?

Please circle

Not at all satisfied *Very satisfied*

1 2 3 4 5

SECTION TWO

The following questions relate to the course you attended.

6. In relation to aspects of course content, how satisfied were you with each of the following:

Relevance to your work

Please circle

Not at all satisfied *Very satisfied*

1 2 3 4 5

Takes account of prior knowledge and experience

Please circle

Not at all satisfied *Very satisfied*

1 2 3 4 5

Extends your knowledge

Please circle

Not at all satisfied *Very satisfied*

1 2 3 4 5

7. In relation to aspects of the *level* of the course you attended, how satisfied were you with the appropriateness of each of the following:

Technical language and terminology

Please circle

Not at all satisfied *Very satisfied*

1 2 3 4 5

Theoretical content

Please circle

Not at all satisfied *Very satisfied*

1 2 3 4 5

Practical content

Please circle

Not at all satisfied *Very satisfied*

1 2 3 4 5

8. How satisfied were you that the course content took appropriate account of everyday police work in Estonia ?

Please circle

Not at all satisfied *Very satisfied*

1 2 3 4 5

9. How satisfied were you with the standard of instruction?

Please circle

Not at all satisfied *Very satisfied*

1 2 3 4 5

10. How satisfied were you that presentations maintained your active interest?

Please circle

Not at all satisfied *Very satisfied*

1 2 3 4 5

11. How satisfied were you that instructional sessions permitted appropriate participation ?

Please circle

Not at all satisfied *Very satisfied*

1 2 3 4 5

12. In relation to organisational arrangements (for example travel, subsistence, accommodation, teaching environment) how satisfied were you with such arrangements ?

Please circle

Not at all satisfied *Very satisfied*

1 2 3 4 5

Please comment further should you wish to do so.

SECTION THREE

The questions in this section concern evaluation and impact of the course.

13. Were you requested to complete an end of course evaluation sheet by course organisers?

Please circle

YES

NO

DON'T KNOW

If YES go to the next question 14, if NO to question 15

14. If yes, did you complete and return the evaluation sheet to the organisers?

Please circle

YES

NO

DON'T KNOW

15. In relation to the area of police work covered by the course, have you since the course had or made use of the opportunity to:

Please circle

a) utilise techniques introduced to you by the course

YES NO DON'T KNOW

b) utilise equipment more effectively

YES NO DON'T KNOW

c) utilise knowledge and expertise gained on the course

YES NO DON'T KNOW

ANY OTHER INFORMATION

There may be specific aspects of the course that you attended or more general issues about police training assistance which you may wish to comment on. Please use the space below for any further comments.

THANK YOU FOR TAKING THE TIME TO COMPLETE THIS QUESTIONNAIRE. YOUR HELP IS GREATLY APPRECIATED.

Please return the questionnaire in the enclosed envelope as soon as possible.

© ABACRU, University of Manchester,
Oxford Road MANCHESTER,
M13 9PL U.K.